

John Tiplady Carrodus: a tale of seven violins

© Nicholas Sackman

www.themessiahviolin.uk

2017-2023

The previously-published edition of this research article has here been significantly extended, partly in light of David L Fulton's *The Fulton Collection: A Guided Tour*, pub. Peter Biddulph Ltd, London, 2021; a postscript was added in June 2023.

1. Biographical summary

John Tiplady Carrodus (JTC) was a distinguished and celebrated English violinist who was born on 20th January 1836 in the village of Braithwaite, near Keighley, in Yorkshire; he was one of six children who survived to adulthood (two further siblings died in infancy). Early violin lessons from his father led to local concerts in which John successfully performed violin solos. In 1848 his father was able to pay for John to have some lessons with the German violinist Bernhard Molique (1802-1869) who was working in London at that time. When financial support could no longer be sustained Molique offered to teach John for free if he could move to Stuttgart where Molique had been appointed Kapellmeister to the King of Württemberg.

After some years in Germany JTC returned to England, and, soon after, was performing at prestigious concerts and rapidly building an enviable reputation. In 1857 he married Charlotte Mary Latham (1838-1889). Nine children can be identified:

Ernest Alexander (1858-1938); double-bassist

Charles Henry (1859-1899)

Harriet (1862-1885)

Bernhard Molique (1866-1935); violinist (named in honour of JTC's teacher)

John Frederick (1867-1917); cellist

William Oliver (1869-1942); flautist

Robert George (1870-1966); violinist

Ada Mary (1872-1947)

Herbert Edwin (1877-1913)

After the death of Charlotte Mary in 1889 JTC married for a second time. Following his own death in 1895 his second wife, Ada, wrote a memoir of his life and work: *J. T. Carrodus, Violinist, A Life Story: 1838 [sic] – 1895* (A. J. Bowden, London, 1897). In this memoir Ada describes how she initially met JTC:

[...] there were concerts (orchestral, promenade and classical) for two weeks in Brighton [...] they commenced in 1869 and carried on for many consecutive years. Of all the artists who appeared, none was a greater favourite or more appreciated than Mr. Carrodus. The writer [i.e. Ada] can speak of this with authority, never having missed one of the festival performances, and having first been introduced to Mr. Carrodus at one of the meetings in 1872 in order to take accompanying lessons with him,¹ and having had the privilege of intimate friendship with him and his family from that time. (*A Life Story*, p.68)

¹ See later for details of Ada – by then Mrs Carrodus – accompanying at a concert in 1895.

Throughout his professional life JTC suffered acutely from a highly-strung nervous temperament, and his ever-increasing responsibilities for teaching and performing created great anxiety, deep depression, and a level of insomnia which meant that, on occasions, he did not sleep for a week at a time. Ada Carrodus writes:

Thus was his life full of work of great importance and his nervous system perpetually on the strain until really he seemed to lose the power to enjoy rest, when he got the chance of it. He has said to the writer, he would lead a much happier life if he could hold a less responsible position, and that if in a back desk of an orchestra with no responsibility – he would be a contented man. (*ibid.*, p.89)

In 1867 JTC was appointed leader of the orchestra, and solo violinist, at the Covent Garden opera house. In 1887, accompanied by a travelling companion, JTC visited the French Riviera, subsequently travelling to Genoa:

[JTC] soon picked up strength, was able to walk and sleep well, and take active interest in everything [...]. In Cannes they met many friends, and were able to enjoy a little social life as well as get about and see the beauties of the place. A peep at Monaco, where the gambling horrified him, and the music at the Casino pleased him much, and then on to Genoa, which, being the scene of Paganini's birth and death [Paganini died in Nice], was full of interest to him. There they met a Mr. Le Mesurier, a great friend of Mr. Carrodus' fellow traveller, who offered them delightful hospitality and acted as their guide for two days through the city. As he was a man of much importance in Genoa, he was able to shew them much that otherwise they could not have seen, and as a mark of special favour, the violin bequeathed by Paganini to the town was removed from the glass case where it is always kept and submitted for inspection to Mr. Carrodus, who much regretted such a notable instrument could not be made use of; the varnish and form impressed him as incomparable. [...] By the time they arrived back in Paris all his old energy and activity of mind and body returned, and the trip home by Rouen, so full of intense interest to a lover of history, was one of unalloyed pleasure. (*ibid.*, pp. 97-99)

Towards the end of his life JTC Carrodus found the time to write a set of short guides for young violinists: *Chats to Violin Students on how to study the Violin*.² Within this volume Carrodus includes two chapters on *Violin Makers – The Italian School*. With respect to his journey to Genoa JTC writes:

Whilst I was on a visit to Genoa some few years ago, I went to the Museum and saw the violin which was in the possession of Paganini, and almost always (in his later years) played on by him. It is a fine specimen of a "Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu." It was left by Paganini to the town of Genoa, with the distinct understanding it should only be played on once a year at the town fêtes. He named Sivori as the player, as he was a pupil of the master [...].³ The violin is a superb specimen and in first-rate preservation. I was not fortunate enough to handle it or hear its tone, but it is a beautiful work of art, and from its excellent condition and the interest attached to it is, perhaps, the most valuable specimen existing.⁴ (*Chats*, pp.56-59)

In the years immediately after the death of his first wife JTC's own health steadily deteriorated:

[...] his condition became so serious that, at the earnest solicitations of his friends and doctors [...] it was determined that early in February 1891 he should take a voyage to Capetown in the company of his son John [John Frederick – JTC's favourite accompanist]. (*A Life Story*, p.101)

In February 1895 Carrodus was the focus of a series of concerts in Yorkshire which celebrated the fifty years during which he had been in the public eye as a performer. Carrodus also received the honorary

² The *Chats* were serialised in monthly issues of *The Strad* (1894) and then combined as 'Library, no. 11', and published in 1895 by "'The Strad' Office'.

³ Evidently the Genoese officials at the Museum had no qualms about disseminating imaginative misinformation.

⁴ It is perhaps significant that Carrodus does not identify Paganini's violin as *il Cannone*; see later in this account for further consideration of this soubriquet.

freedom of the borough of Keighley and was presented with a silver casket, on which was engraved the following text:

Borough of Keighley
Presented by fellow-townsmen and friends to
John Tiplady Carrodus, Esq.
on his admission as an honorary freeman of his native borough
5th February 1895
in token of admiration for his musical genius and of personal esteem.

At a celebratory evening concert Carrodus performed alongside four of his sons: Robert George (violin), Ernest Alexander (double-bass), William Oliver (flute), and John Frederick (cello). Ada's memoir includes (opp. p.110) a group photograph taken at this celebratory occasion which shows the silver casket positioned next to JTC. The identity of JTC's violin cannot be determined from this photograph – which has been cropped by the present writer – but it seems to be a violin of substantial size (cf. p.23 of this account).



Source: Ada Carrodus, 'A Life Story' (1897), opp. p.110; British Library, London. The original, larger, image has been cropped.

The programme for the concert – mostly instrumental solos and duets interspersed with some songs – is reprinted in *A Life Story* (p. 110). The programme-text concludes with:

The accompanying was shared by Miss Carrodus (sister to Mr. Carrodus),
Mr. J. Carrodus, Junr. [i.e. John Frederick], and Mrs. Carrodus [Ada].

A reporter from *The Leeds Mercury* newspaper, following an interview with Ada Carrodus – ‘who distinguishes herself on the platform as an accompanist, is full of information on musical subjects that concern her husband, and fully understands the requirements of the interviewer’ – wrote:

Mr. Carrodus has at present, among his other possessions, two magnificent violins, which, of course, are worth more than their weight in gold. They are fine specimens of the Guarnerius make; *one of them was made in 1744 and the other in 1741*.⁵ The former once belonged to Paganini, who, it is said, gambled it away. It has a red varnish, and is worth £1,000 [see overleaf, p.5]. On account of its wonderfully powerful tone it has received the name of the “Cannon Joseph”. The other one, with an amber varnish, is called the “Yellow Joseph” and it is about half the value of its companion. Before Mr. Carrodus came into possession of those exquisite instruments he used to play on a [1708] Stradivarius.⁶ [...] He also possesses what is called an orchestral violin, made in Germany, when he was studying with Molique, by a maker named Bauer; an instrument not intended for solo work, but for leading the first violins, because of its telling quality of tone, as distinct from the refined and delicate tone necessary in a solo.⁷

It is of critical importance that the label-dates of the two Guarneri violins – 1744 and 1741 – and their varnish colours – respectively red and amber – are unambiguously identified by Ada Carrodus for the benefit of the *Leeds Mercury* reporter. J T Carrodus writes about his two Guarneri violins in the aforementioned *Chats to Violin Students* (pp. 56-59; an illustration lies inbetween):

I myself possess two very fine specimens of his [Guarneri’s] work – one, which is known as the [1744] Cannon Joseph from its powerful tone, is said to have belonged to Paganini, and to have been gambled away by him (see “The Violin” by Davidson). It is a beautiful specimen of the red varnish which is exceptionally fine. Another which I purchased last year [i.e. 1893] has a tone which almost equals the Cannon Joseph, but, being a yellow varnish, is not quite so beautiful in appearance.⁸

Carrodus provides another description of his two Guarneri violins in an article initially published in the *Strand Musical Magazine*, from which a passage was posthumously reprinted in *Strings: The Fiddler’s Magazine* (Vol. II, no. 19, September 1895, p. 114):

To one of the papers in the *Strand Musical Magazine* there attaches a melancholy interest. It is from the pen of the late Mr. J. T. Carrodus. With reference to violins he says: –

[...] I am very fortunate, having a very fine specimen of a Strad, upon which I used always to play and two beautiful Joseph Guarneri del Jesu, upon one of which I invariably play solos now. It is said, by the way, to have belonged to Paganini, and to have been gambled away by him, and called the “Cannon Joseph” on account of its powerful tone. The varnish is in splendid preservation and dark red in colour; the other violin is almost as fine in tone, but artistically not so beautiful to look at, having an amber varnish.

Ada Carrodus concludes her memoir of her husband:

[JTC] started the [1895] opera season as usual, and bore the first six or eight weeks very well – then he seemed to be very poorly, but the doctor made little of it, thought he was suffering from indigestion, and nervous prostration, and we all hoped that a holiday and rest only were required to restore him. However, it was not to be, and his work at the Opera, on the night of July 12th, 1895,

⁵ Italicised emphasis by the present writer.

⁶ See p.7 of this account.

⁷ *The Leeds Mercury*, 5th February 1895, p.8; a further report was published by the *Mercury* on the following day, 6th February, p.3. From the reporter’s elegant expression of gratitude – ‘[Mrs Carrodus] fully understands the requirements of the interviewer’ – one may conclude that the entire content of the quotation came directly from Ada Carrodus.

⁸ Note that the quoted text follows on directly from the text quoted on p.2 of this account: ‘Whilst I was on a visit ...’. See p.10 of this account for the report published in *The Morning Post*, 22nd September 1893, which confirms this purchase of a 1741 *del Gesù* violin.

was followed by a violent attack of acute pain on his return home and a night of great agony, succeeded by unconsciousness, and in this condition he passed away early on the morning of July 13th. (*A Life Story*, pp.112-113)

JTC left an estate valued at £5,433. In August 1897 probate was ‘re-sworn’ after two payments were received: the first, of £405, and the second, of £1,000. The £405 payment was probably made by Bernhard Carrodus to acquire the 1708 Stradivari violin which he had used since 1883 (see p.7). It is all but certain that the payment of £1,000 was made by Robert Carrodus in order to acquire his father’s 1744 Guarneri violin. In a diary entry made three months after JTC’s death, Arthur F Hill (of W. E. Hill & Sons, violin dealers) writes:

8th October 1895: Mr Carrodus’s fine Guarnerius [i.e. the ‘Cannon Joseph’ violin] has become the property of his son Robert, the rest of the family having consented to his taking it at the price we sold it to Mr Carrodus.⁹

The probate documentation shows that the executors for the Carrodus estate were Seth Waring (a resident of Keighley, Yorkshire) and Jonas Earnshaw (a violinist who lived close by the Carrodus residence in north London). JTC had drawn up a Will on 5 February 1891 but within the lengthy text there is no mention of any instruments. A Carrodus family grave, occupied by Charlotte Mary, John Tiplady, Charles Henry, and John Frederick, is at Highgate Cemetery in north London.

2. The Carrodus violins

a) The Martin Bauer violin and the 1714 Giuseppe Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin

In 1855 [aged 19] he [JTC] was able (with the generous assistance of Mr. Walter Broadwood) to purchase a really good violin (by Joseph Guarnerius, son of Andrew) [i.e. Giuseppe Guarneri, *filius Andreae*] for £90. This violin [label-dated 1714] he had already used on several important occasions through Herr Molique’s kind influence. Until then he had used a violin made for him during his student days in Stuttgart by a man named Bauer. He had followed the growth [creation] of this instrument from day to day with the greatest interest, and up to the very last used it at all his orchestral engagements, and it was the one employed at the opera [Covent Garden] the last night of his life. He thought a great deal of its tone, varnish, and form, being an exact copy of a Joseph Guarnerius *del Gesù*. (*A Life Story*, p.50)

According to the Cozio Archive which is hosted on the Tarisio.com website (Tarisio Fine Instruments & Bows) JTC passed (returned?) his 1714 Giuseppe Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin – ID 42390 – to the London violin dealer George Hart in 1870. JTC then used his Bauer violin until 1880 when he bought a 1708 Stradivari violin (see p.7).

The 1714 Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin was subsequently owned by a Dr G W Mackenzie who loaned the violin to the 1885 International Inventions Exhibition (Albert Hall, London). In the exhibition’s *Guide to the Loan Collection and list of musical instruments* the 1714 violin is identified thus:

MACKENZIE, Dr. G. W. – *Violin*, Italian, by Joseph Guarnerius filius Andreae. 1714
For many years the solo instrument of the well-known violinist, Mr. J. T. Carrodus.
The specimen of the maker referred to and illustrated by Mr. G. Hart in his work on the Violin and its Makers.

⁹ David L Fulton, *The Fulton Collection: A Guided Tour*, Peter Biddulph Limited, London, 2021, p.271; hereafter cited as *Fulton21*.

A wood-engraved illustration of the 1714 violin appears in George Hart's *The Violin: its famous makers and their imitators* (1875), Plate 2, opposite p.6. Hart's reference to this violin is brief: 'Mr. John T. Carrodus, the eminent violinist, has a very fine specimen of his [Guarneri *filius Andreæ*] violins [...].'

The Tarisio.com website makes no mention of Dr G W Mackenzie owning the Guarneri *filius Andreæ* violin in 1885; it places the violin with 'W S Hannam' in 1891, the violin seemingly then disappearing from view until 1962.

As indicated, the Bauer violin was made for JTC while he was studying with Molique in Stuttgart. It is likely that Martin Bauer (1793-c.1875) was recommended by Molique; it is also likely that it was Molique who paid for the violin. Whether or not Bauer followed a *del Gesù* model at the request of JTC – whether he 'antiqued' the violin to look appropriately old – whether he labelled the violin with his own name or with an imitation *del Gesù* 'IHS' label (appropriately dated) – none of these questions can be answered. However, what is clear from the testimony of Ada Carrodus is that JTC admired the violin enormously and was using the violin at Covent Garden on the night prior to his death.

JTC writes about his Bauer violin in his *Chats to Violin Students*:

The name of Martin Bauer, born in Stuttgart early this century, is less known than it should be as a maker. Molique had such a high opinion of his creations that he preferred playing on them to any other violins, and only purchased the Strad which he used the latter part of his career through the persuasion of his friend, Signor Piatti. When I was in Stuttgart in 1849, studying with Molique, Bauer made me a violin, the manufacture of which I watched with the greatest interest and attention, and on this instrument I played my solos throughout my early career. I still always use it as my orchestral violin. (*Chats*, p.67)

The Bauer violin was not included in the posthumous auction of some of the Carrodus instruments which took place at the offices of Puttick & Simpson in December 1895; the post-JTC ownership of the Bauer violin is unknown to the present writer.

b) The 1708 Stradivari violin

In his *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer* David Laurie (the Glasgow-based violin dealer) relates a journey to St Petersburg and the acquisition of some Stradivari instruments:

In the spring of [18]76 I received a letter from a lady in St. Petersburg, saying that her late husband had left a collection of high priced stringed instruments, and that several of her friends had advised her to write to me and see if I would buy them. [...] On looking over the receipts I found that nearly all the instruments had been purchased either through J. B. Vuillaume or Gand Frères, Paris, and as they were duly guaranteed by these firms, there could be little doubt of their authenticity. [...] They had, with a few exceptions, been bought many years before, and their value had greatly increased. [...] [On arrival at the lady's residence in St Petersburg] we adjourned to the music room, where the collection was. This I found to consist of three Strad. 'cellos, several violins, and a tenor [viola].¹⁰

¹⁰ *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer*, Chapter XIII, *A Purchase in St. Petersburg*. Laurie's *Reminiscences* were posthumously published by T[homas] Werner Laurie Ltd. but the date of publication is unknown; the publishing house was founded in 1904. The copy of the first edition which is owned by the present writer contains, on the first page, the name of the original purchaser and the date: '1924'. The Introduction to the first edition, by Elsie M Lang, states that Laurie died in 1897, in Brussels, after a long illness. 'Mr Laurie had contemplated issuing these *Reminiscences* at the time they were written, but his illness put a stop to the project and the MSS. lay aside unheeded until his son, Robert, coming across it among his father's papers, sent it to the publishers who at once realized its interest and value.'

Having bought these instruments Laurie then needed to surmount endless difficulties in bringing them all back from Russia to England. He concludes his narrative with:

My collection was soon put in order and ready for sale; one of the Strad. 'cellos 1708, being bought by the late Mr. Carrodus.¹¹

In 1880, four years after his journey to St. Petersburg, Laurie sold two 1708 Stradivari violins, for £480 and £435 respectively;¹² it is very probable that it was one of these violins that was bought by J T Carrodus (see below). JTC passed the violin to his son Bernhard Molique in 1883 when he bought for himself a 1744 Guarneri violin (see p.17; see also the letter from Ada Carrodus, below).¹³

In the January 1896 issue of *The Strad* (p.276) a full-page letter from David Laurie was published under the heading *The Late Mr. Carrodus's Violins*:

To the Editor of *The Strad*

SIR, - Observing that the late Mr. Carrodus's violins were recently disposed of by auction, and as I imported both his "Stradivarius" and "Joseph Guarnerius" to this country, a few particulars regarding them may be interesting and acceptable to all lovers of the violin. As he bought the "Stradivarius" before the "Joseph" my attention naturally turns to it first.

I bought it in the year 1876, in St. Petersburg (along with three "Stradivarius" violoncellos – no less – and other less notable instruments) all having been in the collection of a deceased amateur there. [...] The "Stradivarius" of Mr. Carrodus was a fine and grand looking violin of the "great period", date 1708 [...]. Some years after I sold it, Mr. Carrodus was good enough to send me a MS. written by himself, of the famous "Candenza" [*sic*] for the Beethoven violin concerto, which he got from his master Molique, who composed, but never printed it, and which he only gave to his favourite pupils, causing them to play it from memory, and Mr. Carrodus being one, he sent me this as a mark of gratitude for putting such a violin into his possession.

Contrary to Laurie's claim that 'the late Mr. Carrodus's violins were recently disposed of by auction', the 1708 Stradivari violin was *not* included in the Puttick & Simpson auction of JTC's instruments on 10th December 1895 (see pp.10-11); this reality is confirmed by a note added by the editor of *The Strad* to the end of David Laurie's January 1896 letter:

The two instruments mentioned in [Laurie's] letter were not included in the sale; we understand they are still in the possession of the Carrodus family. – ED.

The editor's understanding was entirely correct; in the February 1896 issue of *The Strad* a letter from Ada Carrodus to the editor was published:

Dear Sir,

[...] Your note to Mr. Laurie's letter with regard to my dear husband's two instruments is quite correct. The Stradivarius [violin of 1708] has been in Mr. Bernhard's possession some years and the Cannon Joseph [violin of 1744] is retained in the family by Mr. Robert Carrodus, both of whom are following their late father's profession. Yours truly, Ada Carrodus.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, p. 108. The cello was surely intended for John Frederick Carrodus to use. Note that four months after JTC died three of his sons – Bernhard, Robert, and John Frederick (together with the viola player W. Richardson) – formed the 'Bernhard Carrodus String Quartet'. One of the quartet's early concerts (20 November 1895) was reported in *Strings: the Fiddler's Magazine* (issue of December 1895, p.165). Ada's letter to *The Strad* (see above) was written just two months later, and her text strongly suggests that at their quartet concert Bernhard would have been playing on the 1708 Strad, while Robert would have been playing the 1744 Guarneri. It is difficult to imagine that John Frederick would have been playing on a cello of any lesser quality.

¹² *Ibid.*, p. [172]; 'Prices of Italian Instruments; extracted from his sales account.' Was one of the 1708 instruments mistakenly listed as a violin rather than as it should have been listed, namely, a cello?

¹³ A few years prior to his purchase of two of Laurie's instruments – i.e. c.1876 – JTC also bought 'a very fine Guarnerius' from W E Hill & Sons 'which he sold to Mr. [William Louis] Winans [1823-1897], the American millionaire who is living at Brighton' (Alfred Hill diary entry, 15th July 1895; see *Fulton21*, p.271; the label-date of the Guarneri is not stated).

NB: In his letter to *The Strad*, Laurie has created confusion through his assumption that the auctioned ‘Joseph Guarnerius’ violin was the 1744 violin which he had bought from J-B Vuillaume (see later, section **2d**) of this account, on p.15); this violin was *not* put up for sale in December 1895. The Guarneri *del Gesù* violin which was auctioned was label-dated 1741 – i.e. it was the aforementioned ‘Yellow Joseph’ which JTC had bought from the Hills in 1893 (see p.10). Evidently, David Laurie did not attend the Puttick & Simpson auction.

c) The 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin

A Guarneri *del Gesù* violin of 1741, with a two-piece back plate, is known as a *Carrodus* instrument (Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com, ID 40255). The website indicates that ‘Carl Mackenzie’ sold the violin in 1882 to the collector Richard Bennett (1848-1930), that Bennett sold it to the Hills in London, and that they sold it to J T Carrodus in 1893; this last information is confirmed by JTC in *Chats to Violin Students: The Italian School* (see earlier in this account) and by a report in *The Morning Post* newspaper (see later, p.10). The website’s colour photographs show a violin with a varnish which might be described as orange/light-brown. The same violin appears in R Hopfner, *Meisterwerke der Geigenbaukunst (Oesterreichische Nationalbank)*,¹⁴ the varnish colour, on the evidence of the photographs, is orange/light-brown. Hopfner reports (p.97) that the text of the label is: “‘Joseph Guarnerius fecit [cross] / Cremona anno 1741 IHS” (41 handwritten).’ He also writes:

The earliest identified owner (at the beginning of the 19th century) was a Scottish nobleman named MacKenzie. He sold the instrument to the violinist François Cramer who in turn sold it to Sir Alexander Mackenzie in 1846. Through the Hill firm it came into the possession of John Tiplady Carrodus, at that time England’s leading violinist. After his death, the violin remained in the possession of the family and was played by his son, Bernard Carrodus.¹⁵ The latter sold it to the collector Mr. Murray, Esquire, of Galashiels, who passed it on to Mr. Horace Fellowes. Through the Hill firm the instrument arrived in the United States in 1948.

Some of Hopfner’s information is mistaken. Peter Davidson, in his 1871 publication, *The Violin: a concise exposition of the general principles of construction theoretically and practically treated*, writes (p.139):

Another well known violin¹⁶ by this eminent maker [Giuseppe Guarneri *del Gesù*] is [currently] the property of the eminent violinist, Mr. A[lexander] C[ampbell] Mackenzie of Edinburgh and is remarkable for its fine quality and intensity of tone. About the year 1800 this violin was, strange to say, also in possession of an A. Mackenzie, from whom it went to Mr. F. Cramer, through Henry Murray, Esq., for the sum of £262. At the sale of the last named gentleman’s effects it was purchased by Mr. Alexander Crombie, Edinburgh, for £105, and in 1846 became the property of the late Mr. Alex Mackenzie, the present proprietor’s father.

Davidson continues (*ibid.*, p. 140):

I subjoin the following verbatim copies of letters relating to the above mentioned violin. The first is a copy of a letter from François Cramer to his son William, dated 1841, which was transmitted

¹⁴ Skira, Milan, 2002, pp. 96-99.

¹⁵ The 1741 Guarneri violin was auctioned by Puttick & Simpson in December 1895, five months after J T Carrodus died. As shown earlier, Bernhard Carrodus played on the 1708 Stradivari violin which his father had bought from David Laurie; see Ada’s letter of February 1896 to *The Strad*.

¹⁶ It is only at the end of this particular narrative (p. 141) that Davidson identifies the violin: ‘The following is a copy of the label on the instrument, “*Joseph Guarnerius, fecit, Cremona, anno 1741, IHS*”.’

in the subsequent letter from Mr. S. W. Forster, to Henry Murray, Esq., Edinburgh, regarding the authenticity of the violin:

LETTER FROM F. CRAMER TO HIS SON WILLIAM

My dear William,

As you wish to have the pedigree of the Joseph Guarnerius Violin I bought forty years ago [i.e. c.1801] of a Mr. Mackenzie, a distinguished Amateur in those days, with a warranty of its being a genuine instrument, and soon after sold it, the gentleman who bought it of me died, and his widow returned it to me for sale, as, of course, she had no use for it after his death. It has never been in any other hands, and I can warrant it being a genuine instrument.

Your affectionate father,

François Cramer

37 Upper Charlotte Street, Fitzroy Square [London]

10th June 1841

LETTER FROM S. W. FORSTER, TO H[enry] MURRAY, ESQ., TRANSMITTING THE PRECEDING LETTER AND RECEIPTS

I have much pleasure in transmitting the copies of the above and hope they will give you additional pleasure when gazing on the instrument to which they refer.

With best wishes for your health, and thanks for favour conferred,

I remain,

Yours respectfully,

S. W. Forster [Simon Andrew Forster?]

13 Macclesfield Street

Soho Square

21st August 1841

The text of Forster's letter clearly implies that Henry Murray, of Edinburgh, was the new owner of the 1741 Guarneri violin (why else would Forster anticipate Murray 'gazing on the instrument'? – why else would Forster send Murray the receipts?). It also implies that Cramer had previously passed the violin – re-acquired from the unknown widow – to his son, William, who, apparently authorised to sell it, had requested from his father a letter confirming the violin's identity and recent history of ownership. It is regrettable that Davidson does not reproduce the receipts which Forster sent to Murray.

The chronology thus becomes:

- At the start of the nineteenth century, a 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin was sold for £262 by a Mr Mackenzie to the violinist François (Franz) Cramer; the intermediary was Henry Murray (about whom no further details are known).
- Soon after this date Cramer sold the violin to an unknown purchaser. At the death of the latter (on an unknown date but, clearly, before 1841) his widow returned the violin to Cramer 'for sale'.
- In 1841 Cramer passed the violin to his son, William.
- Having received his father's 'pedigree' letter William then sold the violin, in 1841, through S W(?) Forster, to Henry Murray of Edinburgh (assumed to be the same person as above).
- At the posthumous sale of the effects of Henry Murray the violin was bought for £105 by Alexander Crombie.
- In 1846 Crombie sold the violin to Alexander Mackenzie (1819-1857).
- Alexander Mackenzie subsequently passed the violin to his son, Alexander Campbell Mackenzie (1847-1935) who later became the Principal of London's Royal Academy of Music (between 1888 and 1924) and was knighted in 1895.

Adding the aforementioned information from the Tarisio.com website

- Alexander Campbell Mackenzie sold the violin in 1882 to Richard Bennett for £400 (see p.11).
- At an unknown date Bennett sold the violin to W. E. Hill & Sons.
- The Hills sold the 1741 violin to J T Carrodus in 1893 for £350 (see quotation, overleaf, p.11).

A report published in the London newspaper *The Morning Post* on 22nd September 1893 confirms that J T Carrodus bought the 1741 Guarneri violin in that year:

Mr. Carrodus, the eminent violinist, who is the possessor of the famous Joseph Guarnerius del Gesù violin, known as the Canon Joseph, which is valued at £1,000, has recently added another fine specimen of the same make to his interesting collection. Its characteristics are great power and a wonderful sweetness of tone, and it is said to be equal in some respects to the historic fiddle supposed to have been gambled away by Paganini. The [new] instrument is dated 1741. It has had the good fortune nearly always to fall into the hands of distinguished professional performers, and is, consequently, in a perfect state of preservation. It was sold by Simon Andreas [Andrew] Forster to Francois Cramer,¹⁷ and for some years was in the family of Dr. Mackenzie, Principal of the Royal Academy of Music. It eventually came into the possession of Messrs. Hill and Co., the well-known Bond-street dealers, from whom it was purchased by Mr. Carrodus.

In *Fulton21* an extract from the diary of Arthur F Hill shows that on 8th October 1895 Ada Carrodus took to W E Hill & Sons the 1741 Guarneri violin, six bows, a viola, a cello, and the violin made for JTC by Martin Bauer of Stuttgart. It is therefore assumed that the Hills acted on behalf of the Carrodus family in placing seven of these items (but not the Bauer violin) into the 10th December 1895 Puttick & Simpson auction: three violin bows (two by François Tourte and one by James Tubbs), an ‘old viola’ an ‘old viola bow’, an ‘old violoncello’, and the 1741 Guarneri violin. At the auction one of the two Tourte bows was bought by ‘Morris’ for £21, the other was bought by ‘Carrodus’ for £12; the Tubbs bow was bought by ‘Hart’ for six Pounds and fifteen shillings (£6.75). The ‘old Viola’ was bought by ‘A Carrodus’ for £10, and the ‘old viola bow’ by ‘Briggs’ for £2; the ‘old Violoncello of somewhat small proportions’ was bought by ‘Warren’ for £10. The following text was printed in the auction catalogue for the 1741 Guarneri violin:¹⁸

Lot 14 A Violin, by Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu, in 1741, with case

The history of this Instrument is recorded in a book entitled “THE VIOLIN”, by Davidson, and is confirmed by the papers attached to the instrument. About the year 1800, this instrument was in the possession of a Mr. A. Mackenzie, it was bought from him by François Cramer – a celebrated violinist of his day – and in 1841 it was sold to a Mr. Henry Murray by S. A. Forster, a descendant of the well known violin maker, William Forster, and joint author with Sandys of “THE HISTORY OF THE VIOLIN”. At the sale of Mr. Murray’s effects it was purchased by a Mr. Alexander Crombie of Edinburgh, and in 1846 it became the property of Mr. Alexander Mackenzie, and afterwards of his son Sir Alexander C[ampbell] Mackenzie, the Principal of the Royal Academy of Music. Later it became one of the instruments in the collection of Mr. Richard Bennett of Lever Hall, and when this collection was dispersed by Messrs W. E. Hill and Sons it was sold by them to the late Mr. Carrodus.

The writer of this historical chronology has clearly made full use of the information from Peter Davidson (see earlier – pp.8-9). According to the handwritten notes made by the Puttick & Simpson

¹⁷ As shown earlier, François Cramer obtained his violin from Mr Mackenzie.

¹⁸ A copy of the auction catalogue, together with the auctioneer’s ‘sold to’ annotations, is held at the British Library, in London. It is this December 1895 auction to which David Laurie refers in his January 1896 letter to *The Strad*.

auctioneer the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin was sold to ‘Dancock’ (G W Dancocks) for £370 (GBP). An anonymous report of the auction subsequently appeared in *The Violin Times* (January 1896, pp. 35-36); the author was probably one of the two editors of the journal – Eugene Polonaski and Edward Heron-Allen. With respect to the 1741 violin the report includes the following commentary:

The violin realised £370, and it may interest many to know that the price Mr Carrodus paid Messrs. Hill for it in 1893 was £350, and that when it was sold in 1882 by an agent acting on behalf of Sir Alexander Mackenzie the price obtained for it was £400. It goes without saying that this Guarnerius was not one of the finest examples of this great maker, and that its preservation and appearance were far from perfect. [...] Several notices of the [auction] sale have appeared in the Press, and from them inferences have been drawn presuming that this [1741] Guarnerius was another on which Mr. Carrodus played for about the last fifteen years of his life, and used as his solo instrument. This latter violin [i.e. the 1744] the family retain,¹⁹ and it is hardly necessary to add that it is in every sense a much finer and more valuable instrument than the one that has just been sold.

Following the death of G W Dancocks the same 1741 violin was auctioned again, on 26th October 1915, again by Puttick & Simpson:

Catalogue of the valuable collection of violins, violas, and violoncellos
formed by the late G. W. Dancocks, Esq., of Hook, Surrey
(sold by order of the Public Trustee).

Lot 187 (out of Lots 171-201) was the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin. The auction catalogue repeats all the historical information which had been provided in the 1895 catalogue, adding (after ‘... sold by them to the late Mr. Carrodus’) ‘at the dispersal of this collection by Messrs. Puttick and Simpson in 1895, [the violin] was purchased by the late owner’ [i.e. G W Dancocks]. The British Library’s copy of the sale catalogue, as used by the auctioneer, has two handwritten annotations, in ink, appended to the text which describes the 1741 violin:

& documents from 1841-1895
with Messrs. W. E. Hill & Sons, & G. Hart guarantees

The auctioneer’s ‘sold to’ documentation indicates that Lot 187 was sold to ‘Minster’ for £580 (GBP). Evidently, the ‘documents from 1841-1895’ – i.e. the ‘papers attached to the instrument’ at the 1895 auction – were still in existence in 1915. It would seem that between 1895 and 1915 these documents were supplemented by the guarantees provided by W. E. Hill & Sons and by George Hart.

In December 1915 an auction report – *Violins under the hammer* – was published in *The Strad* (p. 230). The reporter – ‘T.P.’ (Towry Piper?) – begins his account with:

A sale of musical instruments held by Messrs. Puttick and Simpson at their Auction Rooms on the 26th of October last proved an event of considerably greater interest than those which have taken place since the war began, and a number of violins and basses from private collections were disposed of; a special catalogue comprising the collection of the late Mr. G. W. Dancocks being issued. The lots dispersed numbered 216, and in a few cases fair prices were obtained in spite of the unfavourable condition of the market. [...]

Naturally the chief interest was centred in the violin by Guarneri *del Gesù*, dated 1741, which was sold to Mr. Minster, an American buyer as the writer understands, for £580. This was one of the two “Josephs” formerly owned by the late J. T. Carrodus; the other [i.e. the 1744 violin] is still in the possession of that artist’s family, unless we are misinformed.²⁰ This [1741] fiddle is described

¹⁹ See Ada’s letter of February 1896 to *The Strad*.

²⁰ T.P., in 1915, was indeed misinformed; see pp.20-21 of this account.

in Davidson's book, and amongst its former owners may be mentioned François Cramer, Sir Alexander Mackenzie, and Mr. Richard Bennett, the well-known collector. The varnish is yellow-golden, and, accepting as correct the measurements given to the writer (13 15/16th inches [354mm]), the body is of unusual length. The instrument is guaranteed by Messrs. Hill and Messrs. Hill.

A definitive identification of 'Mr. Minster' has not been established but it is almost certain that he was Leonard Rollman Minster (1887-1969) who was a grandson of Isaac Rollman, the founder of Rollman & Sons, a major department store in Cincinnati, Ohio, USA. It is very likely that Mr Minster subsequently returned to the US with his 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin.²¹

In September 1947 two American violin dealers, Rembert Wurlitzer and Kenneth Warren, travelled to England to acquire high-quality violins, violas, and cellos, for export back to the US. During this trip Wurlitzer (at Warren's suggestion) made a hurried detour to Scotland to purchase an unexpectedly-available 1741 Guarneri violin from the Glasgow dealer Andrew Smillie (1879-1948). Having bought the violin Wurlitzer 'asked Mr. Hill to write a certificate on it'²² (see pp.13-14 for what is assumed to be the requested certificate). On 17th January 1950 Wurlitzer sold his 1741 'Smillie' violin – now identified as a *Carrodus* violin on the strength of A E Phillips Hill's history letter – to the American violinist, businessman, and philanthropist, Max Adler (d.1952).

A letter, written by Kenneth Warren, giving an account of Wurlitzer's purchase in Glasgow, was published in the *Chicago Sunday Tribune* on 23rd July 1950.²³ Having described the events of September 1947 Warren adds that in the spring of 1950 he saw the 1741 Guarneri violin in the hands of the American violinist Aaron Rosand, 'and I encouraged him to buy it'. Rosand did not act upon Warren's encouragement, instead eventually buying from Wurlitzer the Guarneri violin known as the *Kochanski*.

In a letter to Mr Adler (4th August 1950) Wurlitzer states that the former's newly-purchased violin was for many years in the possession of ~~John~~ [sic] Bernard Carrodus and of his father.

Clearly, Wurlitzer (1) did not know that JTC bought his yellow/amber 1741 Guarneri violin in 1893, just two years before he died; (2) knew nothing of the 1895 and 1915 auctions (and Mr Minster of Cincinnati); (3) did not know that Bernhard Carrodus played on a 1708 Stradivari violin rather than a 1741 Guarneri.

Wurlitzer also informed Adler that the latter's violin

is described in a small book which Mr. Carrodus wrote on his method of violin playing.

This 'small book' is the aforementioned collected edition of JTC's *Chats to Violin Students* within which there is only one brief reference (hardly a description) to the 1741 violin:

Another [Guarneri violin] which I purchased last year has a tone which almost equals the Cannon Joseph, but, being a yellow varnish, is not quite so beautiful in appearance. (*Chats*, p.59)

On 29th June 1954 the 1741 violin was sold by Mr Robert S Adler to Continental Galleries of Fort Worth, Texas (President: Mr C M Paul) accompanied by the following documents:

²¹ William Henley, in his listing of Guarneri *del Gesù* violins, identifies the 1741 *Carrodus* violin and comments: 'Sold at Puttick's for £370, 1895. Passed over to America 1920.' (*Universal Dictionary of Violin and Bow Makers*, Vol. II, p. 255). At the 1915 auction Mr Minster also bought a 1763 Guadagnini violin (Lot 188) for £300. The present writer is indebted to Miss Christine Windheuser (Smithsonian Institution) for her ingenious investigations which resulted in the identification of Leonard Rollman Minster.

²² Letter from Rembert Wurlitzer to Max Adler, 4th August 1950.

²³ Warren mistakenly identifies the violin in question as the *Hegedus*, which is label-dated 1734.

1. a certificate from Hart & Son, London, dated 18th January 1924
2. a certificate from W. E. Hill & Sons, London, dated 15th December 1947
3. a ‘copy’ certificate from Rembert Wurlitzer, dated 16th January 1954 in which Wurlitzer dates the violin as ‘circa 1739’. It is assumed that this was a copy of a certificate which had been issued in 1950 when the violin was sold to Max Adler.²⁴

Kenneth Warren also refers to JTC’s ‘method’ book in a letter which he sent to C M Paul on 30th June 1954; Warren locates ‘mention of your [1741] violin’ within the book’s Preface. The Preface to *Chats* was written by Henry Saint-George, is dated August 1895, and does not contain any mention of the 1741 Guarneri violin. On the following day Warren sent another letter to C M Paul acknowledging his mistaken identification of Paul’s violin as the *Hegedus* in his *Chicago Sunday Tribune* article.

If the 1741 Guarneri violin which was bought by C M Paul in 1954 was the same violin as had been bought by Mr Minster in 1915, and if, by 1954, the only supportive documents for the violin were the three certificates listed above, then it would seem that all the ‘documents from 1841-1895’ and the ‘Messrs. W. E. Hill & Sons, & G. Hart guarantees’ that were with the violin at the 1915 Dancocks auction had disappeared. If Leonard Rollman Minster, being American, took the 1741 violin with him to the USA then why was it apparently back in London in 1924, with George Hart writing a ‘duplicate’ guarantee/certificate on the 18th January?:

We certify that the *Violin*, purchased of us by *H. S. Murray Esq. of Galashiels* is the work of *Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù*.

Remarks: *A fine example of the maker dated 1741. Handsome wood, golden brown varnish.*

Hart & Son

*Geo. Hart*²⁵

It is unclear whether this is a duplicate of the Hart guarantee which was identified at the 1915 Dancocks auction, or a duplicate of an entirely new certificate which was issued, for the first time, in 1924. It is noticeable that Hart does not associate H S Murray’s 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin with J T Carrodus, and his vague ‘Remarks’ could be applied to almost any *del Gesù* violin from 1741; he does not even specify whether the violin’s back plate is in one, or two, pieces, nor the quality or direction of the flames. No photographs are attached to the certificate, an absence which renders the document largely irrelevant.

The W. E. Hill & Sons certificate of 15th December 1947 – seemingly that which was requested by Rembert Wurlitzer following his trip to Glasgow in September 1947 – states:

We certify that the *Violin in the possession of The Rudolf Wurlitzer Company of New York, U.S.A.* was made by *Joseph Guarnerius del Gesu* and bears a label dated 1741.

Description *The back in two pieces of handsome wood marked by a small curl descending slightly to the right, that of the sides is more pronounced, the head of faint and broad curl. The table of even and rather open grain and the varnish of a golden brown colour. This instrument is a characteristic example of the above period of the maker’s work. William E. Hill & Sons*

An accompanying letter (same date) sets out the history of this violin ‘as far as it is known to us’:

²⁴ The Wurlitzer copy certificate was conveyed to C M Paul by Leonard M Sperry on 12th August 1954, but, as C M Paul notes (with evident irritation) ‘the Certificate is incomplete’ without the ‘history letter’ which had accompanied the Hill certificate of 15th December 1947. Sperry writes again to C M Paul on 12th November 1954 stating that ‘we have finally received a copy [...] of their [history] letter of December 15, 1947, concerning your Guarnerius del Gesu. Unfortunately, they neglected to sign it.’

²⁵ Italicised text is handwritten on the certificate; all else is pre-printed. A scan of the document was received by the present writer from the Oesterreichische Nationalbank.

During the latter part of the last century, it was in the hands of one of our leading professional players, J. T. Carrodus, who was a pupil of Molique and later led the Royal Covent Garden Orchestra in London. After his death, it remained in his family for some time being used by his son who was also a professional player. He [the son] later sold it to Sir Alexander Mackenzie. From him it passed into the hands of Mr. Murray of Galashiels, the owner at one time of many fine instruments, who sold it to Mr. Horace Fellowes, a well known Violin Professor and quartet player, living in Glasgow and in whose possession it has remained until recent times.

Signed: William E. Hill & Sons.²⁶

It is assumed that both the certificate and letter were written by Albert Edgar Phillips Hill;²⁷ the three Hill brothers – William Henry, Arthur Frederick, Alfred Ebsworth – had all died (1927, 1939, and 1940 respectively). It is disconcerting that A E Phillips Hill should write that after JTC's death the 1741 violin remained in the Carrodus family 'for some time' – or that JTC's son (which son?) 'later' sold the 1741 Guarneri violin to Sir Alexander Mackenzie – or that Sir A C Mackenzie sold the violin to H S Murray. As already indicated, the 1741 violin was auctioned in December 1895 and bought by G W Dancocks; the violin was auctioned again in 1915, bought by Mr Minster, and, almost certainly, taken to the US. Surely A E Phillips Hill was aware of the outcome from these two auctions? – the firm of W. E. Hill & Sons had enjoyed a close commercial relationship with Puttick & Simpson (as had George Hart).²⁸ In his autobiography²⁹ Sir Alexander Campbell Mackenzie makes no mention of a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin, nor does he mention John Tiplady Carrodus or a Carrodus son.

Hart's 'H. S. Murray Esq. of Galashiels' and the Hills' 'Mr. Murray of Galashiels' both refer to the same person – Henry Smith Murray – who was born in 1858. His family's business, under the guidance of his father, John (d.1892), was in the woollen trade, with extensive interests in the Australian sheep market. As a result, the firm of Sanderson & Murray became internationally famous and the family enormously wealthy. The family's residence was at the newly-designed and -built Scots-baronial house named 'Glenmayne' (construction c.1870) just outside the town of Galashiels on the banks of the river Tweed. At an unknown date towards the end of the century H S Murray took up the position of Major and Lieutenant-Colonel in the 1st Roxburgh and Selkirk Rifle Corps; he died at 'Glenmayne' on 10th March 1924. Clearly, Henry Smith Murray (of Galashiels) is not Henry Murray (of Edinburgh) who died in the early 1840s.

Horace Fellowes (1875-1975), a Professor of Violin at the Scottish Academy of Music, is not to be confused with Edmund Horace Fellowes who was a Church of England clergyman and also a musicologist who did much to promote 16th- and 17th-century music. Such confusion is evident on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com web page for the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin (ID 40255), and the confusion is compounded by the website's erroneous identification of 'Enthoven' and 'Charles Davis' as owners of the violin after Horace Fellowes. Henry Chapman Enthoven owned a 1741 Guarneri violin with a one-piece back plate (the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin has a two-piece back plate) which was inspected by the Hills in London, and by Charles Gand in Paris, around 1880-1881.³⁰ After Enthoven's death in 1897 his violin was bought by Charles Davis, was then sold to the collector Richard Bennett, and from Bennett passed to the violinist Paul Kochanski who retained possession until his death in

²⁶ The 'signature' is typed rather than handwritten. Note that the letter makes no mention of the Hills having sold the violin to J T Carrodus in 1893.

²⁷ Albert Edgar Phillips was the stepson of Arthur Frederick Hill. In 1940 Phillips bought the firm of W. E. Hill & Sons and altered his surname to fit.

²⁸ See James Coover, *Music at Auction*, Harmonie Park Press, Detroit, 1988, p. 35.

²⁹ *A Musician's Narrative*, Cassell & Co. Ltd., London, 1927.

³⁰ A description, dated 1881, of Enthoven's Guarneri violin appears in Charles Gand's *Catalogue descriptif*, p.99. Enthoven's violin has no documented existence prior to 1880. See section 2e) of this account for information about Charles Gand and his *Catalogue*.

1934. This *Kochanski* violin then sat for many years in the vaults at Rembert Wurlitzer's violin-dealership in New York until it was bought in 1957 by the American violinist Aaron Rosand (see p.12 of this account).

Information received by the present writer indicates that Professor Horace Fellowes sold his Guarneri *Carrodus* violin to a Mrs Burger (biographical details are unknown) and she sold the violin in 1933 to an unknown purchaser; this person *may* be the route by which the violin reached Andrew Smillie in Glasgow. One might have expected Smillie to provide Rembert Wurlitzer with his own written assurance with respect to the recent history of the 1741 violin but no such document is known. Given that Wurlitzer immediately requested a Hill certificate for the violin (see p.12) it would seem that Smillie, in September 1947, could only provide Wurlitzer with Hart's incomplete certificate of 1924; evidently, Smillie did not have the 1841-1895 documents nor the 1915 Hill and Hart certificates.

Wurlitzer's own certificate of 16th January 1954 was accompanied by three photographs of the 1741 Guarneri violin. Distinctive markings on the front and back plates can be seen to be replicated in the photographs of the violin produced by the Sotheby auction house in London when they auctioned the 1741 'ex-Carrodus' violin on 19th March 1986.³¹ In their auction catalogue Sotheby's identify only the same three certificates as listed earlier in this account.

No photographic documentation was provided in 1895 when the 1741 Guarneri violin which had belonged to J T Carrodus was auctioned by Puttick & Simpson; similarly at the 1915 auction. Given this deficiency – given, also, the disappearance of all the 'papers and documents' and the Hill and Hart certificates – given the unsatisfactory condition of Hart's 'duplicate' certificate of 1924 – and given the inaccuracies contained in the Hills' history letter – it cannot be securely demonstrated that the violin which Rembert Wurlitzer bought in Glasgow in September 1947 had any previous connection with J T Carrodus.

d) The 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin

The evidentially-supported history of this violin begins with Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume who, in 1855, sold a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin to the violinist Louis Eller (who was born at Graz, Austria, 9th June 1820); the price of the violin was 5,000 francs. As a virtuoso violinist Eller successfully toured the principal European countries and gave many concerts in the south-west of France, especially in and around the town of Pau. In the late 1850s Eller was afflicted with an incurable disease which progressively prevented him from performing. In the spring of 1862 his medical condition worsened markedly and he died on 12th July 1862 at the age of 42.

1855 hatte er noch in Paris einem kostbaren Guarnerius (Joseph) für 5000 Francken erstanden, und erst seit er in den Besitz dieses herrlichen Instrumentes getreten war, fühlte er sich in der Beherrschung seines Materials vollkommen unbeschränkt.

In 1855, in Paris, he bought a precious Giuseppe Guarneri [violin] for 5,000 Francs; only after he came into possession of this magnificent instrument did he feel completely unfettered in the mastery of his [musical] material.³²

³¹ The same markings can be observed in the photographs provided in Rudolf Hopfner's *Meisterwerke der Geigenbaukunst*, pp. 96-97.

³² Biographical information and quotation (present author's translation) sourced from *Zur Erinnerung an Louis Eller*, Rudolf Kuntze, Dresden, 1864.

David Laurie, in his *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer* (p.144), provides the following narrative:

A young and very eminent violinist who lived in Vienna, in the [eighteen] seventies, was ordered to Pau for his health. He went in the early spring, and before the summer came he died there.³³ A marquis and his lady, who were staying at Pau, were very kind to him and previous to his death had him removed to their house, where they tended him with the greatest kindness until the end. He had with him a splendid Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu violin which he bequeathed to his kind friends. In course of time they also died and his violin was for sale. As soon as I heard of it I took steps to procure it and managed to do so, although at a very high price.

See § below for the continuation of Laurie's text.

Laurie does not identify the young violinist, nor the names of the kind Marquis and his wife, nor the dates when the couple died, their deaths resulting in the Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (of as-yet unspecified label-date) coming onto the market.

In his aforementioned letter of January 1896 to *The Strad* (see p.7) and after having written at some length about the 1708 Stradivari violin which he sold to J T Carrodus, David Laurie then turns to the "Joseph Guarnerius" violin, and, through his letter, expands his *Reminiscences* narrative:

A few years after [the death of the young violinist] both the Marquis and his lady died, and the violin with other things were to be sent to Paris and sold, but I did not know this until I had gone to Pau, where I got the address of the *avocat* who had charge of the estate, [the *avocat* being] in Paris to whom I applied on my return.³⁴ He informed me he had sent the instrument to Vuillaume the great [*sic*] to get it valued, and would then treat [negotiate] with me, but as I had never seen [the Guarneri violin] I asked him for a note [addressed] to Vuillaume to allow him to shew it to me. I was very much struck with [the violin], it being different to any other "Joseph" I had ever seen. ***It was a rough, carelessly made one, date 1744, but its state of preservation was perfect***, having still its original hand [neck/peg-box/scroll] and the [bass-] bar inside had never been changed. Its wood, although not showy, was perfect in quality for tone.³⁵

Thus the chronology for this Guarneri *del Gesù* violin, a violin now unambiguously dated by Laurie (and Ada Carrodus) to 1744, was: Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume, Louis Eller, unidentified Marquis and wife, unidentified Paris lawyer, and, again, J-B Vuillaume. Given the close commercial relationship between Vuillaume and Laurie it is quite likely that the former alerted the latter to the violin's existence ('as soon as I heard of it I took steps to procure it ...'). It would seem that, with Vuillaume's valuation having been established, Laurie bought the Guarneri violin ('at a very high price') through the lawyer who was handling the estate of the deceased Marquis and his wife.

Laurie continues:

§ [The violin with its 'original hand'] had been in my possession only a short time when I sold it to an artiste in Germany, a pupil of De Bériot, who had carried off first prize and medal from the Conservatoire of Music in Brussels amid general acclamation. (*Reminiscences*, p.144)³⁶

Rudolf Gleichauff entered the Brussels Conservatoire in 1846, was taught by de Bériot, and won 'le prix d'honneur' in 1849; the Carrodus-Carmichael letter (see p.17) confirms that the 'artiste in Germany' was Gleichauff.

³³ Laurie's narrative is incorrectly located in the 1870s rather than the 1860s.

³⁴ The Carrodus-Carmichael letter (see p.17) dates the arrival in Paris of the *ex- Eller* violin to the year 1872.

³⁵ Italicised emphasis by present writer. It is unclear whether it was the 'original hand' and the unchanged bass-bar which made the violin 'different to any other "Joseph" I had ever seen'.

³⁶ Charles Auguste de Bériot (1802-1870) taught at the Brussels Conservatoire between 1843 and 1852. If the *ex- Eller* violin was returned to Paris in 1872, and was then in Laurie's hands for 'only a short time', perhaps Laurie's sale of this violin to his 'artiste in Germany' took place in 1873 or 1874.

This gentleman professed to be greatly pleased with the instrument, as well he might, for it was in perfect state of preservation. Even the original hand was on it (although it had been lengthened at the upper inside block in the body by a wedge) a very rare thing in a Guarnerius del Jesu. I drew [the purchaser's] attention to this fact most particularly and begged, as a great favour, that he would not meddle with it as even though its thickness was a little greater than that of a modern hand, he would very soon get accustomed to it. Also I pointed out that although [the violin] had the original bass bar it had been remounted in all other respects by Vuillaume and did not require any further alteration [...]. (*Reminiscences*, pp.144-145)

Six or seven months elapsed before Laurie discovered that, despite his implorings, Gleichauff had had the violin's neck replaced, as well as the bass-bar and the sound-post, the last two alterations resulting in the violin having 'the left [bass] side of the table falling in, while the right side was above the level from the centre to the edge of the *f*.' Laurie bought back the violin from Gleichauff and 'brought the violin to Paris and placed it in the hands of MM. Gand & Bernardel to be put right again.'

A search of the online archives of the Gand/Bernardel/Caressa & Francais business ledgers for the period 1866-1875 (Musée de la musique, Paris) reveals that between February 1873 and March 1876 Laurie bought seventeen instruments by Stradivari, Guarneri, Bergonzi, Guadagnini, etc. costing a total of 50,000 francs; Laurie also bought three Tourte bows. Within these business ledgers there is no listing of a repair to the *ex-Gleichauff* violin but perhaps the cost of such a repair was 'lost' inside the enormous profit made by G&B on all the sold instruments and there was no need to enter the details in the ledger ('*Grand Livre*').

In his letter to *The Strad* Laurie writes: 'I then brought [the violin] to London and sold it to an amateur there [Caspar Gottlieb Meier, see overleaf], who gave it to a dealer in London afterwards to sell for him, and from whom Mr. Carrodus finally purchased it.' Laurie concludes his *Reminiscences* narrative (pp.148-149) with the same information but expressed slightly differently: 'I [then] sold [the violin] to a well-known amateur who eventually placed it on sale with Mr. Hill. It became the property of the late M. Carrodus.' Documentary evidence indicates that the Hills put the violin on sale at £1,000 (see also p.5 of this account) with, probably, c.£800 to be paid to Meier when the violin was sold.

A letter written by J T Carrodus on 17th January 1895 to the song-composer Mary Carmichael (1851-1935) contains the following information about his 'Joseph Guarnerius' violin:

In reply to your letter I will give you what information I can about my Joseph Guarnerius which is however scanty. In the appendix of a book by Davidson (now out of print) it says "that the Violin is supposed to have been the one gambled away by Paganini". I have never proved this further. I have a certificate which I got with the Violin of Villaume [*sic*] of Paris which says it passed from his hands in 1833 sold to Eller whom he calls a celebrated Violinist. In 1872 it was returned to Villiaume [*sic*] & afterwards sold to Mr. Rudolf Gleichauff by Mr. Laurie of Glasgow. I bought it through Hill's of 34 Bond St about 12 years ago [i.e. c.1883].

With kind regards

Yrs very sincerely

J. T. Carrodus

It is clear that Vuillaume's certificate, which identified Louis Eller as 'a celebrated violinist', was with Meier's violin when JTC bought it from the Hills in 1883, and was still with JTC in 1895.

One aspect of Vuillaume's certificate as reported by Carrodus – 'which says it [i.e. JTC's 1744 Guarneri violin] passed from [Vuillaume's] hands in 1833 sold to Eller' – is implausible. It is not likely that Louis Eller bought a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin from Vuillaume when Eller was aged just twelve or thirteen; a purchase in 1855 (as is clearly identified in the 1864 Eller memoir) is much more believable. The probability is that Carrodus mis-read Vuillaume's numerals – especially the French '5's – and, as a result, mistakenly wrote '33' in his letter to Mary Carmichael (Vuillaume's slanted and ornate handwriting can be extremely difficult to read). Given the mental and physical strain under which JTC

was living during this final year of his life – England’s most celebrated violinist and constantly at the beck and call of everyone in the musical world – such a mistake, within a hurriedly written response to a letter of enquiry, would be understandable. The spelling mistakes – *Villaume*, *Villiaume* – are likely also attributable to the same debilitating tensions.

The ‘book by [Peter] Davidson (now out of print)’ was a revised and enlarged edition of his 1871 publication *The Violin: a concise exposition of the general principles of construction theoretically and practically treated* (Porteous Brothers, Glasgow), the new edition being re-titled as *The Violin: its construction theoretically and practically treated* (F. Pitman, London, 1880). Writing (pp. 278-9) about David Laurie’s career, and listing many of the instruments with which Laurie was involved as buyer or seller, Davidson identifies

the “Canon” Joseph Guarnerius Violin, *ex Vicomte* ____, Pau, now owned by C. G. Meier, Esq. London; a very large and handsomely wooded Violin, with beautiful red varnish, said to have been the Violin Paganini lost at play.

Clearly, the Vicomte (of Pau) connects precisely with the ‘kind Marquis and his wife’ described by David Laurie, and there is no reason to doubt Davidson when he identifies C G Meier as the pre-1880 owner of the ‘very large’ Guarneri violin which had ‘beautiful red varnish’.³⁷ Davidson’s pre-1880 information is confirmed within Laurie’s *Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer* which contains (p. [172]) a partial listing of instruments which he sold:

‘Prices of Italian Instruments

The following entries are extracted from his sales account’

Within the entries is the following item:

Dec. 28, 1877. – Joseph Guarnerius violin (“Canon”) £620 [GBP]

Notwithstanding the absence of a purchaser’s name all the evidence points towards C G Meier being the purchaser of Laurie’s ‘Joseph Guarnerius violin (“Canon”)’; it is C G Meier who is Laurie’s aforementioned ‘amateur’ (or ‘well-known amateur’). A revised narrative for this 1744 violin can be constructed thus:

- Louis Eller, who, in 1855 buys a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin from Vuillaume
- the Marquis (or Vicomte) and his wife, residing at Pau
- the Parisian *avocat* and Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume; in 1872 J-BV writes a valuation for the *ex-Eller* violin (and in July 1873 reports to his brother that he has ‘set up the Joseph [Guarneri violin] which [Luigi] Tarisio called the Gun’; see overleaf, p.19)
- David Laurie, who purchases the 1744 Guarneri violin ‘at a very high price’
- Rudolf Gleichauff, who allows the violin to be damaged
- David Laurie, who retrieves the violin from Gleichauff, has it repaired in Paris, and brings it to London
- C G Meier, who, in December 1877, buys from Laurie the very expensive violin (with ‘beautiful red’ varnish) which the latter identifies in his sales register as the ‘Joseph Guarnerius violin (“Canon”)’; Meier pays £620 for the violin.
- Meier subsequently consigns this violin to the Hills in London; it is priced at £1,000 with C G Meier likely receiving *c.*£800 on completion of a sale.

³⁷ ‘Pre-1880’ since Davidson’s revised and enlarged volume was published in 1880.

- the Hills sell the violin to J T Carrodus in 1883; Carrodus was therefore the owner of Laurie's "Canon" violin *four years before he travelled to Genoa and saw Paganini's bequeathed violin*³⁸
- the 1895 letter from JTC to Mary Carmichael identifies his violin as that which Vuillaume sold to Louis Eller
- the information given in 1895 by Ada Carrodus to the reporter from the *Leeds Mercury* confirms JTC's violin as being dated 1744 and as having red varnish.

The catalogue for the 1998-99 exhibition *violons, Vuillaume: un maître luthier français du XIX^e siècle* at the Musée de la musique in Paris illustrates (pp. 182-183) a Vuillaume violin which is stated to be an imitation of Paganini's *Cannone* violin. The associated commentary, written by Emmanuel Jaeger, states:

D'après une lettre de Vuillaume à son frère Nicolas-François du 27 juillet 1873, il s'avère que le surnom du violon de Paganini (le Canon), légué à la ville de Gênes par le virtuose en 1837, ne lui avait pas été donné par son propriétaire:

« J'ai monté le Joseph [Guarneri] que Tarisio appelait le Canon.³⁹ En effet il a une puissance qui justifie ce sobriquet et il fera joliment l'affaire d'un grand artiste. »

From a letter sent by Vuillaume on 27 July 1873 to his brother Nicolas-François we learn that the nickname for Paganini's violin (the Cannon), the violin which was bequeathed to the town of Genoa by the virtuoso in 1837, was not one which was bestowed upon it by its owner:

"I have set up the Joseph [Guarneri violin] which [Luigi] Tarisio called the Gun. Indeed it has a strength of tone which justifies this sobriquet and it will do nicely for a great artiste."

Vuillaume's comment resonates powerfully within this historical study, in no small part because the date of Vuillaume's letter to his brother fits robustly with the previously-described movement of the *ex- Eller* violin during 1872. It is here proposed that Luigi Tarisio, having obtained a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin from an unknown source and on an unknown date, sold the violin (which he had named *il Cannone*) to Niccolò Paganini, possibly when the latter was in Paris in 1833.⁴⁰ Paganini, in his correspondence, identifies *il mio cannone violino*, for the first time, in a letter of 16th July 1833 to his agent, Luigi Germinio.⁴¹ Following Niccolò's death in 1840 his son, Achille, sells the *Cannone* violin to J-B Vuillaume who then sells it to Louis Eller in 1855. Clearly, this 1744 *del Gesù* violin cannot be that which was acquired by the city of Genoa on 4th July 1851. When the Tarisio/*Cannone*/Paganini/Vuillaume/ Eller violin returns to Paris in 1872 it is through J-BV that it is then sold, 'at a very high price', to David Laurie (having been 'set up' by J-BV in the summer of 1873). J-BV conveys the violin's nickname to Laurie together with an indication of a connection between the violin and Niccolò Paganini; Laurie, in turn, passes Vuillaume's information onto C G Meier, and eventually, via the Hills, it reaches J T Carrodus.

³⁸ Present writer's italics. Having bought the Laurie/Meier/Hill "Canon" violin in 1883, JTC would have had some serious questions to put to the Genoese officials if, in 1887, he had discovered that the violin which he was shown was being identified as the *Cannone*; JTC would surely have told his Genoese hosts that *he* was the owner of the "Canon" violin. David Laurie's presentation of the word "Canon" is assumed to be a quirk of his personal style of spelling.

³⁹ Luigi Tarisio would have used the Italian word *cannone* ('gun') rather than *canone* ('norm', 'rule'); in French the word *canon* is used for both meanings.

⁴⁰ Paganini was in Paris between February-April 1831, March-June 1832, and September 1832-April 1833.

⁴¹ Prior to 16th July 1833 Paganini only ever writes *il mio violino*.

In her 1897 memoir Ada Carrodus writes of her husband's 1744 violin:

In this year also [the year 1883 is clearly implied by both the preceding and the succeeding text] he purchased through Mr. Laurie of Glasgow, the fine specimen of "Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu" which he used always as his solo violin. The tone is so fine and powerful that it is known as the "Cannon Joseph" and by some authorities is said to have been one of Paganini's violins which he gambled away. It is now in the possession of his son Robert (his sixth son), a violinist of distinction.

(*A Life Story*, pp.88-89)

In the Preface to her memoir, Ada Carrodus writes that 'With no notes from the pen of the subject of these memoirs [i.e. JTC], I feel hesitation in writing them [...]. Working from her historically-limited first-hand knowledge, Ada's identification of David Laurie, rather than the Hills, as the 1883 origin of her husband's "Cannon Joseph" violin is likely nothing more than a simple misunderstanding caused by the content of Laurie's January 1896 letter to *The Strad* (see earlier, pp. 7 and 16). JTC's letter to Mary Carmichael makes clear that he bought his 1744 violin from the Hills. Ada may have misunderstood the (non-)involvement of David Laurie but she could not be mistaken when she identifies Robert George Carrodus as the post-JTC owner and player of the 1744 'Cannon Joseph' violin. However, career prospects for instrumentalists at the turn of the century were dire, and Robert's ownership apparently lasted only a few years before the violin was once again on sale.

Curiously, Arthur Hill's diary shows that it was not until January 1905 that he and his younger brother, Alfred, learned from whom David Laurie had obtained the 'Cannon' Guarneri violin which the Hills had sold to J T Carrodus twelve years earlier, in 1893:

9th January 1905: [Mr G Herbert], in answer to Alfred's enquiry, [has] given us the name of the artist to whom the Joseph Guarnerius known as the 'Cannon' belonged. This violin we obtained from C. G. Meier, who in his turn bought it from Laurie. It is one of the finest and we sold it to the well known English violinist, J. F. [*sic*] Carrodus. Laurie would never say where he got it, but we [now?] know it was from an artist at Pau. This man was Louis Eller, born at Gratz [*sic*] 1819 [1820], died at Pau 1862.⁴²

Thus the existence of Louis Eller was apparently unknown to the Hill brothers prior to January 1905.

A F Hill's diary entry demonstrates that the Hills were not aware of Vuillaume's certificate when the *ex- Eller/Vuillaume/Laurie* violin was consigned to them by C G Meier around 1880 (yet such a certificate, with its identification of Louis Eller, was in JTC's hands in 1895). 'Alfred's enquiry' indicates that there was still no certificate with the violin when the Hills sold it to Major C E S Phillips in 1904.⁴³ Perhaps this non-existence was the prompt for the letter of enquiry to be sent to Mr G Herbert. Major C E S Phillips held onto the violin for just four years.

3rd July 1910: We obtained it [JTC's 1744 Guarneri] from C. G. Meier, and this last named bought it from David Laurie, previous to which it belonged to Gleichauff and a violinist of the name of Eller. With the exception of Bernhard, none of Carrodus's sons – and several are trained musicians – are doing well. John the cellist is, I am afraid, in a bad way.⁴⁴ I could not keep reproaching him for not offering us his late father's fine Guarnerius when the family made up their mind to sell it.

Robert, another of the sons, had the use of this [1744 Guarneri] violin, and one day [in 1902-03?], to our amazement, we learnt that it was for sale at Joseph Chanot's for £1,000. We acted promptly, and got [George] Hart, who is intimate with Chanot, to buy it, for the violin was of course worth much

⁴² A F Hill diary entry; see *Fulton21*, p.271; note A F Hill's naming of the violin as 'the 'Cannon''.

⁴³ *Fulton21*, p.270. The Tarisio.com/Cozio Archive, ID 40447, incorrectly states that the sale to Major Phillips was in 1895.

⁴⁴ John Frederick Carrodus would die in 1917, aged 49.

more; the fact of the Carrodus family omitting to offer the fiddle to us, knowing their father's relations with ourselves, is a striking proof of their business ineptitude.⁴⁵

On 29th October 1908 Arthur Hill writes in his diary that his brother, Alfred, is en route for Paris, taking with him 'the fine Guarnerius which formerly belonged to Paganini and Carrodus.'⁴⁶ In May 1909 Arthur reports that, during his continental trip, Alfred sold the Guarnerius which is 'associated with the name of Carrodus' to Dr Felix Landau of Berlin for £2,100; Arthur describes the violin as 'one of the finest existing specimens of the maker'. If Dr Landau's Guarneri violin is the violin which Rudolf Gleichauf allowed to be damaged then the repairs carried out by Gand & Bernardel at David Laurie's request must have been of perfect workmanship. Even if the repairs were immaculate it is difficult to see how the post-repair violin could have been described by Arthur Hill as exhibiting 'magnificent preservation' (A F Hill diary, 26th October 1908); perhaps Arthur Hill was describing a different violin.

e) Charles-Nicolas-Eugène Gand

From 1870 onwards, until one year before he died (1892), Charles Gand, the Paris-based violin dealer, compiled the 252 descriptions of Stradivari and Guarneri instruments which make up his *Catalogue descriptif des Instruments de Stradivarius et J Guarnerius*.⁴⁷

Charles Gand's descriptions of instruments – two on each page of the *Catalogue* (except for page 2 which is entirely taken up with a description of the *Le Messie* violin) – are written in black ink, followed by details, in red ink, of previous owners (always shown as *Ex*) and subsequent owners (for whom, of course, the prefix *Ex* is not used), e.g. a 1740 Guarneri violin described by Gand in 1882 (*Catalogue* p.114):

Ex Adams
1885 M. Wilmotte 22,000 [French francs]
1889 Mademoiselle Mess, 24,500

Each description also identifies the name of the owner of the instrument on the date when Gand noted down his observations; in the above case it is David Laurie. The 252 descriptions are assumed to be either of instruments which were bought or sold through Gand & Bernardel Frères, or instruments which were repaired and maintained by the workshop personnel. Some of the descriptions may be of instruments which Gand saw in the possession of Parisian colleagues.

The measurements supplied by Gand – usually only for the body length of the instrument – use the French system known as the 'Foot of the King' (*Pied du Roi*) as had also been used, sixty years earlier, by Il Conte Ignazio Alessandro Cozio di Salabue, in which one *pouce* is equivalent to 27.07mm and one *ligne* is 2.26mm.

⁴⁵ A F Hill diary; see *Fulton21*, p.273. Robert Carrodus joined the second violins of the London Symphony Orchestra in 1909 and was promoted to the first violins in 1914. As a soldier he was wounded in action in July 1918 but survived the war and remained a member of the LSO until 1924. Subsequently, in 1934, Robert was leader of the orchestra of the Carl Rosa Opera Company; he died in 1966.

⁴⁶ The Paganini/Carrodus ownership is mentioned again in a diary entry dated 7th December 1908 and yet again in an entry dated 11th January 1909; clearly, A F Hill was convinced of Paganini's ownership. The label-date of the Paganini/Carrodus violin is never mentioned in A F Hill's diary extracts as are presented in *Fulton21*.

⁴⁷ Gand's *Catalogue* was published as a photographic facsimile, in 1994, by Les Amis de la Musique, Spa, Belgium.

On the upper half of p.87 of his *Catalogue* Gand writes a description of a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* belonging to David Laurie; the date of the description is 1879:

(année 1879) Monsieur Laurie, Glasgow (Ecosse)
 Violon Joseph Guarnerius, 13 pouces 1 ligne, année 1744
 Fond d'une pièce, belles ondes remontant à droite, jolies éclisses
 Table de deux pièces, beau sapin un peu fin au milieu, cassure au-dessus de l'f gauche à l'endroit de la barre. Tête cassée à la cheville du La, trous de la chanterelle et du La rebouchés. Vernis jaune doré.
 1879 M^r Gleichauff, 8,000 f. ⁴⁸

(1879) M. Laurie, Glasgow, Scotland
 Giuseppe Guarneri [*del Gesù*] violin, 13 *pouces* 1 *ligne* [354.2mm], year 1744
 The back plate is in one piece, *beautiful flames rising* [from left] *to right*.⁴⁹ Attractive ribs.
 The front plate is made from two pieces, beautiful spruce, [the growth rings] slightly narrow in the middle. There is a split above the bass-side *f*-hole in the area of the [bass-] bar.
 The head [has been] broken at the A-string peg; the holes for the E-string and the A-string pegs have been bushed. *The varnish is golden yellow*.
 1879 M. Gleichauff, 8,000 francs.

On 29th June 1879 David Laurie sold a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin for the sum of £320 (GBPs).⁵⁰ The purchaser is not identified but 1879 is the same year in which Charles Gand wrote his *Catalogue descriptif* text (above), and Gand indicates that 1879 was the year in which Gleichauff bought Laurie's golden-yellow 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin for 8,000 francs. In the late nineteenth century the exchange rate between British Pounds and French Francs was 1:25; Laurie's sale price of £320 converts, exactly, to 8,000 French Francs. The evidence clearly points towards Rudolf Gleichauff buying Laurie's golden-yellow 1744 Guarneri violin as a replacement for the large, red 1744 Guarneri violin which Gleichauff had bought from Laurie some years earlier (1873-74), which he had allowed to be damaged, and which he had then sold back to Laurie.

f) The 1743 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (erroneously known as the *Carrodus*)

A 1743 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (ID 40447) – soubriquet *Carrodus* – is listed on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com website. The sequence of ownership (with some inaccurate dates of ownership) is stated to be Louis Eller, J-B Vuillaume, David Laurie, Rudolf Gleichauff 'until c.1879', Laurie, C G Meier '1881-1886', W. E. Hill 'from 1886', and J T Carrodus 'until 1895'. Further owners are listed as Major C E S Phillips '1895-1909',⁵¹ Felix Landau '1909-1949', Ossy Renardy, Henry Hottinger, Rembert Wurlitzer, E P Engleman, David Fulton, and the present owner who, anonymously, loaned the violin to the Australian Chamber Orchestra for the use of the orchestra's leader, Richard Tognetti.

The present writer has tried to access a photograph of this violin's internal label – without success.

⁴⁸ One noticeable absence from Gand's descriptive text is any red-ink annotation that this violin was *Ex Eller*. Gand's French text is copied – exactly, and without any annotations regarding post-Gleichauff owners of the violin – in the two descriptive ledgers compiled during the early twentieth century by personnel at the Paris firm of Caressa & Français; see *Jacques Francais Rare Violins Inc., Photographic Archive and Business Records* (Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of American History, Archives Center, Washington; Box 55, Folder 2 and Folder 4); a comprehensive study of these ledgers can be accessed through www.themessiahviolin.uk.

⁴⁹ Italicised emphasis by the present writer.

⁵⁰ See *Reminiscences*, p.[172].

⁵¹ Major Charles Edward Stanley Phillips was a pioneer in the science of radiology. He was an accomplished violinist and owned a Stradivari violin.

In the 1998 publication *Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù*,⁵² hereafter cited as *Biddulph98*, the following commentary for the ‘Carrodus 1743’ violin appears in Volume One, p.131:

[David] Laurie sold the violin to a musician from Frankfurt called Gleichhoff, a pupil of de Bériot. [...] it is mistakenly listed in Charles-Eugène Gand’s notebooks of 1879 as belonging to the year 1744.⁵³ Around 1881 Laurie sold it in London to C. G. Meier, a wealthy amateur who owned several fine Stradivari violins. After some five years Meier sold it to W. E. Hill, who passed it to the London violinist J. T. Carrodus, whose name it still bears.

If Gand’s only mistake was to write ‘1744’ rather than ‘1743’ then the clear implication is that in all other respects Gand’s description of the golden yellow 1744 violin should match the *Biddulph98* description of the 1743 violin. However, within *Biddulph98* it is further stated that –

‘the wood of the back [plate of the 1743 violin], one piece of quarter-sawn maple, has a modest figure compared to some of del Gesù’s more spectacular violins’ (cf. Gand’s description of his 1744 violin: ‘beautiful flames’)

in *Biddulph98*, Vol. Two, p.109, it is stated that the varnish of the 1743 Carrodus violin is ‘orange-brown’ (cf. Gand: ‘golden yellow’)

in *Biddulph98* the back-length of the violin is specified as ‘352.5mm’ (cf. Gand: ‘354.2mm’)

in *Biddulph98* the three bout-width measurements are specified as 167, 109, and 204mm. These four measurements define a violin of only moderate size; Peter Davidson describes C G Meier’s *ex- Eller/Laurie* violin as ‘very large’ (see p.18 of this account).

Photographs of the one-piece back plate of the ‘Carrodus 1743’ violin show faint flames which gently descend from left to right (*Biddulph98*, Vol. One, opp. p.131). The Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com photographs of the violin confirm the descent of the back-plate flames from left to right, as do the photographs of the violin in the 2015 *The Strad* calendar for the month of December, and the photographs in *Fulton21* on pp. 266 and 269. Clearly, this 1743 violin is not the golden yellow 1744 violin which is described by Charles Gand – *belles ondes remontant à droite* – ‘beautiful flames rising [from left] to right’ (see p.22). It is difficult to understand how such a fundamental physical contradiction can apparently be ignored by dealers, owners, and commentators. Gand did not make a mistake when, in 1879, he reported the label-date of the Laurie/Gleichhauff £320/8,000-francs violin as ‘1744’.

The 1743 violin which is identified on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com website as the ‘\$15 million’ violin loaned to the Australian Chamber Orchestra may have been made by Guarneri *del Gesù* but the historical evidence does not demonstrate an association between this violin and John Tiplady Carrodus.

3. Summary

The two Guarneri *del Gesù* violins owned by John Tiplady Carrodus were

1. a 1741 violin with ‘amber’ (or ‘yellow’) varnish which can be traced back at least as far as François Cramer. It was bought by JTC from the Hills in 1893. This violin was auctioned in December 1895 and sold to G W Dancocks, and then, in 1915, was auctioned again and sold to Mr Minster. The history of this violin, post 1915, is uncertain.

⁵² C Chiesa *et al.*; pub. Peter Biddulph, London, 1998; two volumes.

⁵³ No evidential justification for the statement regarding Gand’s ‘mistake’ is offered.

2. a 1744 violin – ‘very large’ and with ‘red’ (or ‘dark red’) varnish – which was briefly in the hands of Rudolf Gleichauff during which time it was damaged. The violin was subsequently bought by JTC from the Hills, in London, in 1883. The violin was used by Robert George Carrodus for about seven years after JTC’s death in 1895.

The golden-yellow 1744 Guarneri violin sold in 1879 by David Laurie through Charles Gand to Rudolf Gleichauff has no connection with the very large/red/dark-red/1744 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin (see 2. above). The history of the golden-yellow 1744 violin, post Gleichauff, is unknown.

Postscript 1

In October 2017 (following the web-publication of the first edition of the present account) the writer received an email from a violin dealer in Basel, Switzerland; the email was CC’d to two well-known violin dealers in London. The text began with:

‘I would like to advise you to **withdraw** your internet article “John Tiplady Carrodus: a tale of seven violin”. Little of it is correct.’

The emboldening is as in the sender’s email.

Ensuing correspondence indicated that the sender’s position was that the present-day ‘Tognetti’ violin (in Australia) – a violin identified by the sender of the email as ‘the 1743 *ex*-Carrodus/Eller’ – was

- a) one of the *del Gesù* violins which was owned by John Tiplady Carrodus, notwithstanding all the documentary evidence which indicates that the *ex*-Eller/Carrodus violin was label-dated 1744, not 1743;
- b) was the violin which was sold by W. E. Hill & Sons to Major C E S Phillips in 1895, the sender of the email thus endorsing, forcefully, the Tarisio.com/Cozio Archive chronology – see section **2f**) of this account.

The reader will have to decide whether the evidence presented in the present account is convincing and trustworthy or whether ‘little of it is correct’; the reader may also wish to consider why the email was sent.

Postscript 2 (June 2023)

In the June 2023 issue of *The Strad* Gennady Filimonov presented an article (pp. 42-47) titled ‘On the trail of a Russian nobleman’. Because the article was too long to be printed in its entirety some of Filimonov’s information was placed, as an Addendum, on an internet location:

<https://www.thestrads.com/lutherie/on-the-trail-of-a-1708-stradivari-jt-carrodus-and-a-mystery-violin/16402.article?clearcache=1>

This Addendum was titled ‘On the trail of a 1708 Stradivari: J. T. Carrodus and a mystery violin’.

a) Readers of the present writer’s research – i.e. the research which is presented over the course of the previous 23 pages – may wish to compare the cropped photograph of the Carrodus-family musicians which appears herein on page 3 (and which was web-published by the present writer in 2017) with that which appears at the start of Filimonov’s Addendum.

b) Readers may also wish to refer to the text of the February 1896 letter from Ada Carrodus to the editor of *The Strad* which is found herein at the bottom of page 7 and which, as web-published in 2017, included **two editorial insertions** made by the present writer (see over):

Dear Sir,

[...] Your note to Mr. Laurie's letter with regard to my dear husband's two instruments is quite correct. The Stradivarius [**violin of 1708**] has been in Mr. Bernhard's possession some years and the Cannon Joseph [**violin of 1744**] is retained in the family by Mr. Robert Carrodus, both of whom are following their late father's profession.

Yours truly,
Ada Carrodus.

Comparison can be made with the text which appears in Filimonov's Addendum:

Dear Sir, Your note to Mr. Laurie's letter with regard to my dear husband's two instruments is quite correct. The Stradivarius [violin of 1708] has been in Mr. Bernhard's possession some years and the Cannon Joseph [violin of 1744] is retained in the family by Mr. Robert Carrodus, both of whom are following their late father's profession. Yours truly, Ada Carrodus.

In Filimonov's Addendum there is no acknowledgement of the source of his Carrodus-family photograph, nor any acknowledgement of the source of his Ada Carrodus letter-text.

Further information about JTC's 1744 Guarneri violin can be found in the present writer's research article – 'Niccolò Paganini's *Cannone* violin and David Laurie's "Canon" violin; some considerations' (www.themessiahviolin.uk)

The reader might also wish to consult the present writer's article *The 'Bass of Spain' and the 'Vaslin-Gallay': two cellos of Cremona* (www.themessiahviolin.uk).

Nicholas Sackman: Associate Professor, Department of Music, University of Nottingham (retired).

Author of *The 'Messiah' violin: a reliable history?* (2015); see the themessiahviolin.uk website for details.

Author of an historical study of the Stradivari *Habeneck* violin, published in the *Journal of the American Musical Instrument Society*, 2016, and re-published on the website. Author of an historical study of the Stradivari *Chant du Cygne* violin (*Journal of the Galpin Society*, spring 2017). Author of a study of the 'original' neck of the Stradivari *Soil* violin (see website). Author of an extensive and detailed investigation into the reality of the 1724 Stradivari violin which Count Cozio di Salabue sold in 1817 to Niccolò Paganini (see website). Author of an historical study of the Stradivari *Chant du Cygne* violin (*Journal of the Galpin Society*, March 2017). Author of a transcription and translation of the complete sales-ledger archive of Jacques Francais (Smithsonian Institution, Washington DC, USA); see website. Author of a comprehensive study of the decorated Stradivari instruments at the Palacio Real in Madrid, Spain; see website. Further investigative articles are available from the website; all are free-to-read.