

John Tiplady Carrodus: a tale of seven violins

Nicholas Sackman

© 2017

Second edition, issued 25th June 2017, with minor corrections

1. Biographical summary

John Tiplady Carrodus (JTC) was a distinguished and celebrated English violinist who was born on 20th January 1836 in the village of Braithwaite, near Keighley, in Yorkshire; he was one of six children who survived to adulthood (two further siblings died in infancy). Early violin lessons from his father led to local concerts in which John successfully performed violin solos. In 1848 his father was able to pay for John to have some lessons with the German violinist and composer Bernhard Molique (1802-1869) who was working in London at that time. When financial support could no longer be sustained Molique offered to teach John for free if he could move to Stuttgart (where Molique had been appointed Kapellmeister to the King of Württemberg).

After some years in Germany JTC returned to England, and, soon after, was performing at prestigious concerts and rapidly building an enviable reputation. In 1857 he married Charlotte Mary Latham (1838-April 1889). Five of their male children can be identified:

Ernest Alexander (1858-1938); double-bassist

Bernhard Molique (1866-1935); violinist (named in honour of JTC's teacher)

John Frederick (1867-?); cellist

William Oliver (1869-1942); flautist

Robert George (1870-1966); violinist.

After the death of Charlotte Mary JTC married for a second time. Following his own death in 1895 his second wife, Ada, wrote a memoir of his life and work: *J. T. Carrodus, Violinist, A Life Story: 1838 [sic] – 1895* (A. J. Bowden, London, 1897). In this memoir Ada describes how she initially met JTC:

[...] there were concerts (orchestral, promenade and classical) for two weeks in Brighton [...] they commenced in 1869 and carried on for many consecutive years. Of all the artists who appeared, none was a greater favourite or more appreciated than Mr. Carrodus. The writer [i.e. Ada] can speak of this with authority, never having missed one of the festival performances, and having first been introduced to Mr. Carrodus at one of the meetings in 1872 in order to take accompanying lessons with him,¹ and having had the privilege of intimate friendship with him and his family from that time. (*A Life Story*, p. 68)

Throughout his professional life JTC suffered acutely from a highly-strung nervous temperament, and his ever-increasing responsibilities for teaching and performing created great anxiety, deep depression, and a level of insomnia which meant that, on occasions, he did not sleep for a week at a time. Ada Carrodus writes:

Thus was his life full of work of great importance and his nervous system perpetually on the strain until really he seemed to lose the power to enjoy rest, when he got the chance of it. He has said to the writer, he would lead a much happier life if he could hold a less responsible position, and that if in a back desk of an orchestra with no responsibility – he would be a contented man. (*ibid.*, p. 89)

¹ See later for details of Ada – by then Mrs Carrodus – accompanying at a Carrodus concert in 1895.

In 1867 JTC was appointed leader of the orchestra, and solo violinist, at the Covent Garden opera house.

Ada Carrodus relates that in early 1887, accompanied by a travelling companion, JTC visited the French Riviera, subsequently travelling to Genoa:

[JTC] soon picked up strength, was able to walk and sleep well, and take active interest in everything [...]. In Cannes they met many friends, and were able to enjoy a little social life as well as get about and see the beauties of the place. A peep at Monaco, where the gambling horrified him, and the music at the Casino pleased him much, and then on to Genoa, which, being the scene of Paganini's birth and death [Paganini died in Nice], was full of interest to him. There they met a Mr. Le Mesurier, a great friend of Mr. Carrodus' fellow traveller, who offered them delightful hospitality and acted as their guide for two days through the city. As he was a man of much importance in Genoa, he was able to shew them much that otherwise they could not have seen, and as a mark of special favour, the violin bequeathed by Paganini to the town was removed from the glass case where it is always kept and submitted for inspection to Mr. Carrodus, who much regretted such a notable instrument could not be made use of; the varnish and form impressed him as incomparable. [...] By the time they arrived back in Paris all his old energy and activity of mind and body returned, and the trip home by Rouen, so full of intense interest to a lover of history, was one of unalloyed pleasure. (*ibid.*, pp. 97-99)

Towards the end of his life J T Carrodus found the time to write a set of short guides for young violinists: *Chats to Violin Students on how to study the Violin* (serialised in monthly issues of *The Strad* and then combined as 'Library, no. 11', and published in 1895 by "The Strad" Office'). Within this volume Carrodus writes two chapters on *Violin Makers – The Italian School*. With respect to his journey to Genoa JTC writes:

Whilst I was on a visit to Genoa some few years ago, I went to the Museum and saw the violin which was in the possession of Paganini, and almost always (in his later years) played on by him. It is a fine specimen of a "Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu." It was left by Paganini to the town of Genoa, with the distinct understanding it should only be played on once a year at the town fêtes. [...] The violin is a superb specimen and in first-rate preservation. I was not fortunate enough to handle it or hear its tone, but it is a beautiful work of art, and from its excellent condition and the interest attached to it is, perhaps, the most valuable specimen existing.² (*Chats to Violin Students*, pp. 56-59)

In the years immediately after the death of his first wife JTC's own health steadily deteriorated:

[...] his condition became so serious that, at the earnest solicitations of his friends and doctors [...] it was determined that early in February 1891 he should take a voyage to Capetown in the company of his son John [John Frederick – JTC's favourite accompanist]. (*A Life Story*, p. 101)

In February 1895 Carrodus was the focus of a series of concerts in Yorkshire which celebrated the fifty years during which he had been in the public eye as a performer. Carrodus also received the honorary freedom of the borough of Keighley and was presented with a silver casket, on which was engraved the following text:

Borough of Keighley
Presented by fellow-townsmen and friends to
John Tiplady Carrodus, Esq.
on his admission as an honorary freeman of his native borough
5th February 1895
in token of admiration for his musical genius and of personal esteem.

² It is perhaps significant that Carrodus does not identify Paganini's violin as *Il Cannone*; see later in this account for further consideration of this soubriquet.

At a celebratory evening concert Carrodus performed alongside four of his sons: Robert George (violin), John Frederick (cello), Ernest Alexander (double-bass), and William Oliver (flute). Ada's memoir includes (between pp. 110 and 111) a group photograph taken at this celebratory occasion which shows the silver casket positioned next to JTC who is surrounded by the four sons; all five men have their instruments with them. JTC, seated, is holding his violin on his left thigh, the violin upright and with its front plate facing the camera; the violin appears to be of substantial size.



The programme for the concert – mostly instrumental solos and duets interspersed with some songs – is reprinted in *A Life Story* (p. 110). The programme-text concludes with:

The accompanying was shared by Miss Carrodus (sister to Mr. Carrodus),
Mr. J. Carrodus, Junr. [John Frederick], and Mrs. Carrodus [i.e. Ada].

A reporter from *The Leeds Mercury* newspaper, following an interview with Ada Carrodus – ‘who distinguishes herself on the platform as an accompanist, is full of information on musical subjects that concern her husband, and fully understands the requirements of the interviewer’ – wrote:

Mr. Carrodus has at present, among his other possessions, two magnificent violins, which, of course, are worth more than their weight in gold. They are fine specimens of the Guarnerius make; one of them was made in 1744 and the other in 1741. The former once belonged to Paganini, who, it is said, gambled it away. It has a red varnish, and is worth £1,000. On account of its wonderfully powerful tone it has received the name of the “Cannon Joseph”. The other one, with an amber varnish, is called the “Yellow Joseph” and it is about half the value of its

companion. Before Mr. Carrodus came into possession of those exquisite instruments he used to play on a Stradivarius, which is now used by his son Robert. [...] He [JTC] also possesses what is called an orchestral violin, made in Germany, when he was studying with Molique, by a maker named Bauer; an instrument not intended for solo work, but for leading the first violins, because of its telling quality of tone, as distinct from the refined and delicate tone necessary in a solo.³

It is of critical importance that the label-dates of the two Guarneri violins – 1744 and 1741 – and the varnish colours – respectively red and amber – are unambiguously identified for the benefit of the *Leeds Mercury* reporter. J T Carrodus writes about his two Guarneri violins in the aforementioned *Chats to Violin Students* (pp. 56-59; an illustration lies inbetween):

I myself possess two very fine specimens of his [Guarneri's] work – one, which is known as the Cannon Joseph from its powerful tone, is said to have belonged to Paganini, and to have been gambled away by him (see “The Violin” by Davidson). It is a beautiful specimen of the red varnish which is exceptionally fine. Another which I purchased last year has a tone which almost equals the Cannon Joseph, but, being a yellow varnish, is not quite so beautiful in appearance.⁴

Carrodus provides another description of his two Guarneri violins in an article initially published in the *Strand Musical Magazine*, from which a passage was posthumously reprinted in *Strings: The Fiddler's Magazine* (Vol. II, no. 19, September 1895, p. 114):

To one of the papers in the *Strand Musical Magazine* there attaches a melancholy interest. It is from the pen of the late Mr. J. T. Carrodus. With reference to violins he says:-

[...] I am very fortunate, having a very fine specimen of a Strad, upon which I used always to play and two beautiful Joseph Guarneri del Jesu, upon one of which I invariably play solos now. It is said, by the way, to have belonged to Paganini, and to have been gambled away by him, and called the “Cannon Joseph” on account of its powerful tone. The varnish is in splendid preservation and dark red in colour; the other violin is almost as fine in tone, but artistically not so beautiful to look at, having an amber varnish.

Ada Carrodus concludes her memoir of her husband:

[JTC] started the [1895] opera season as usual, and bore the first six or eight weeks very well – then he seemed to be very poorly, but the doctor made little of it, thought he was suffering from indigestion, and nervous prostration, and we all hoped that a holiday and rest only were required to restore him. However, it was not to be, and his work at the Opera, on the night of July 12th, 1895, was followed by a violent attack of acute pain on his return home and a night of great agony, succeeded by unconsciousness, and in this condition he passed away early on the morning of July 13th. (*A Life Story*, pp. 112-113)

2. The Carrodus violins

a) The Bauer violin and the 1714 Giuseppe Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin

In 1855 [aged 19] he [JTC] was able (with the generous assistance of Mr. Walter Broadwood) to purchase a really good violin (by Joseph Guarnerius, son of Andrew) [i.e. Giuseppe Guarneri, *filius Andreae*] for £90. This violin [label-dated 1714] he had already used on several important

³ *The Leeds Mercury*, 5th February 1895, p. 8; a further report was published by the *Mercury* on the following day, 6th February, p. 3. From the reporter's elegant expression of gratitude – ‘[Mrs Carrodus] fully understands the requirements of the interviewer’ – one may conclude that the entire content of the above quotation came directly from Ada Carrodus.

⁴ See later in this account for the report published in *The Morning Post*, 22nd September 1893, which confirms this ‘last year’ purchase of the 1741 *del Gesù* violin.

occasions through Herr Molique's kind influence. Until then he had used a violin made for him during his student days in Stuttgart by a man named Bauer. He had followed the growth [creation] of this instrument from day to day with the greatest interest, and up to the very last used it at all his orchestral engagements, and it was the one employed at the opera [Covent Garden] the last night of his life. He thought a great deal of its tone, varnish, and form, being an exact copy of a Joseph Guarnerius *del Gesù*. (*A Life Story*, p. 50)

According to the Cozio Archive which is hosted within the Tarisio.com website (Tarisio Fine Instruments & Bows) – ID 42390 – JTC passed his 1714 Giuseppe Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin to the London violin dealer George Hart in 1870. If this violin was bought in 1855 with 'the generous [financial] assistance of Mr Walter [Stewart] Broadwood' then it is curious that JTC should sell the violin fifteen years later, apparently leaving himself with only the Bauer 'orchestral' violin to play on for the next ten years (until, as documented below, he bought a 1708 Stradivari violin from David Laurie).

The 1714 Guarneri *filius Andreae* violin was subsequently owned by a Dr G W Mackenzie who loaned the violin to the 1885 International Inventions Exhibition (Albert Hall, London). In the exhibition's *Guide to the Loan Collection and list of musical instruments* the 1714 violin is identified thus:

MACKENZIE, Dr. G. W. – *Violin*, Italian, by Joseph Guarnerius filius Andreae. 1714
For many years the solo instrument of the well-known violinist, Mr. J. T. Carrodus.
The specimen of the maker referred to and illustrated by Mr. G. Hart in his work on the Violin and its Makers.

A wood-engraved illustration of the 1714 violin appears in George Hart's *The Violin: its famous makers and their imitators* (1875), Plate 2, opposite p. 6. Hart's reference to this violin is brief: 'Mr. John T. Carrodus, the eminent violinist, has a very fine specimen of his [Guarneri *filius Andreae*] violins [...].'

The Tarisio.com website makes no mention of Dr G W Mackenzie owning the violin in 1885; it places the violin with 'W S Hannam' in 1891. The violin seemingly then disappears from view until 1962.

All that is known of the Bauer violin is that, as indicated, it was made for JTC while he was studying with Molique in Stuttgart. It is likely that the maker was recommended by Molique; it is also likely that it was Molique who paid for the violin. Whether or not Bauer followed a *del Gesù* model at the request of JTC – whether he 'antiqued' the violin to look as old as possible – whether he labelled the violin with his own name or with an imitation *del Gesù* 'IHS' label (appropriately dated) – none of these questions can be answered. However, what is clear from the testimony of Ada Carrodus is that JTC admired the violin enormously and was using the violin at Covent Garden on the night prior to his death.

JTC's own comments on his Bauer violin were published posthumously:

While I was a student in Germany I watched a man named Bauer make me a copy of a Joseph Guarnerius, upon which I now fulfil all my orchestral engagements. That I passed many interesting hours in his workshop I need hardly say.⁵

The Bauer violin was not included in the posthumous auction of some of the Carrodus instruments which took place at the offices of Puttick & Simpson in December 1895; the post-1895 ownership of the Bauer violin is unknown.

⁵ *Strings: The Fiddler's Magazine*, Vol. II, no. 19, September 1895, p. 114.

b) The 1708 Stradivari violin

In his *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer* David Laurie (the Glasgow-based violin dealer) relates a journey to St Petersburg and the acquisition of some Stradivari instruments:

In the spring of [18]76 I received a letter from a lady in St. Petersburg, saying that her late husband had left a collection of high priced stringed instruments, and that several of her friends had advised her to write to me and see if I would buy them. [...] On looking over the receipts I found that nearly all the instruments had been purchased either through J. B. Vuillaume or Gand Frères, Paris, and as they were duly guaranteed by these firms, there could be little doubt of their authenticity. [...] They had, with a few exceptions, been bought many years before, and their value had greatly increased. [...] [On arrival at the lady's residence in St Petersburg] we adjourned to the music room, where the collection was. This I found to consist of three Strad. 'cellos, several violins, and a tenor [viola].⁶

Having bought these instruments Laurie then needed to surmount endless difficulties in bringing them all back from Russia to England. He concludes his narrative with:

My collection was soon put in order and ready for sale; one of the Strad. 'cellos 1708, being bought by the late Mr. Carrodus.⁷

In the January 1896 issue of *The Strad* (p. 276) a letter from David Laurie was published under the heading *The Late Mr. Carrodus's Violins*. In this letter Laurie begins by explaining that it was he who imported into England the Stradivari violin and the Guarneri *del Gesù* violin which were subsequently owned by J T Carrodus:

To the Editor of *The Strad*

SIR, - Observing that the late Mr. Carrodus's violins were recently disposed of by auction, and as I imported both his "Stradivarius" and "Joseph Guarnerius" to this country, a few particulars regarding them may be interesting and acceptable to all lovers of the violin. As he bought the "Stradivarius" before the "Joseph" my attention naturally turns to it first.

I bought it in the year 1876, in St. Petersburg (along with three "Stradivarius" violoncellos – no less – and other less notable instruments) all having been in the collection of a deceased amateur there. [...] The "Stradivarius" of Mr. Carrodus was a fine and grand looking violin of the "great period", date 1708 [...]. Some years after I sold it, Mr. Carrodus was good enough to send me a MS. written by himself, of the famous "Candenza" [*sic*] for the Beethoven violin concerto, which he got from his master Molique, who composed, but never printed it, and which he only gave to his favourite pupils, causing them to play it from memory, and Mr. Carrodus being one, he sent me this as a mark of gratitude for putting such a violin into his possession.

In 1880 Laurie sold two 1708 Stradivari violins, for £480 and £435 respectively;⁸ it is probable that one of these sales was to J T Carrodus.

Contrary to Laurie's text, the 1708 Stradivari violin was not included in the aforementioned Puttick & Simpson auction; this posthumous reality is confirmed by a note added by the Editor of *The Strad* to the end of David Laurie's January 1896 letter:

The two instruments mentioned in [Laurie's] letter [i.e. the 1708 Stradivari and the "Joseph"] were not included in the sale; we understand they are still in the possession of the Carrodus family. – ED.

⁶ *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer*, T Werner Laurie Ltd., London, n.d., Chapter XIII, *A Purchase in St. Petersburg*.

⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 108.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. [172].

The editor's understanding was entirely correct. The 1708 Stradivari violin which Robert George Carrodus used during the final years of his father's life (see earlier for the report from *The Leeds Mercury*) was not sent for auction after JTC's death. Robert George used his father's 1744 Guarneri violin as his own concert instrument (see section **d**) for this information from Ada Carrodus) and, most likely, the 1708 Stradivari violin was passed to Robert's older brother, Bernhard. It is assumed that John Frederick Carrodus continued to own and play the 1708 Stradivari cello which his father had bought for him from David Laurie.

Evidently, David Laurie was not present at the December 1895 auction and his letter is based upon an erroneous assumption.

The further history of these instruments is unknown. The Hill brothers (London's premier violin dealers) make no mention of a Stradivari cello dated 1708 in their 1902 monograph, *Stradivari: His Life & Work*, nor is such an instrument identified on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com website (wherein the name 'Carrodus' fails to connect to any Stradivari violin which is label-dated 1708).

c) The 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin

A Guarneri *del Gesù* violin of 1741, with a two-piece back plate, is known as a *Carrodus* instrument (Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com, ID 40255). The website indicates that 'Carl Mackenzie' sold the violin in 1882 to the collector Richard Bennett (1848-1930), that Bennett sold it to the Hills in London, and that they sold it to J T Carrodus in 1893; this last information is confirmed by JTC in *Chats to Violin Students: The Italian School* (see earlier in this account) and by a report in *The Morning Post* newspaper (see later). The website's associated colour photographs show a violin with a varnish which might be described as orange/light-brown. The same violin appears in R Hopfner, *Meisterwerke der Geigenbaukunst (Oesterreichische Nationalbank)*;⁹ the varnish colour, on the evidence of the photographs, is orange/light-brown. However, Hopfner writes: 'The golden-yellow ground coat is slightly cloudy; the original colour varnish has worn off almost completely.' Hopfner reports (*ibid.*, p. 97) that the text of the label is: "'Joseph Guarnerius fecit [cross] / Cremona anno 1741 IHS"' (41 handwritten).' He also writes:

The earliest identified owner (at the beginning of the 19th century) was a Scottish nobleman named MacKenzie. He sold the instrument to the violinist François Cramer who in turn sold it to Sir Alexander Mackenzie in 1846. Through the Hill firm it came into the possession of John Tiplady Carrodus, at that time England's leading violinist. After his death, the violin remained in the possession of the family and was played by his son, Bernard Carrodus.¹⁰ The latter sold it to the collector Mr. Murray, Esquire, of Galashiels, who passed it on to Mr. Horace Fellowes. Through the Hill firm the instrument arrived in the United States in 1948.

Some of Hopfner's information is erroneous. Peter Davidson, in his 1871 publication, *The Violin: a concise exposition of the general principles of construction theoretically and practically treated*, writes (p. 139):

Another well known violin¹¹ by this eminent maker [Giuseppe Guarneri *del Gesù*] is [currently] the property of the eminent violinist, Mr. A C Mackenzie of Edinburgh and is remarkable for its

⁹ Skira, Milan, 2002, pp. 96-99.

¹⁰ The 1741 Guarneri violin was auctioned in December 1895, five months after J T Carrodus died.

¹¹ It is only at the end of this particular narrative (p. 141) that Davidson identifies the violin: 'The following is a copy of the label on the instrument, "*Joseph Guarnerius, fecit, Cremona, anno 1741, IHS*".'

fine quality and intensity of tone. About the year 1800 this violin was, strange to say, also in possession of an A. Mackenzie, from whom it went to Mr. F. Cramer, through Henry Murray, Esq., for the sum of £262. At the sale of the last named gentleman's effects it was purchased by Mr. Alexander Crombie, Edinburgh, for £105, and in 1846 became the property of the late Mr. Alex Mackenzie, the present proprietor's father.

Davidson continues (*ibid.*, p. 140):

I subjoin the following verbatim copies of letters relating to the above mentioned violin. The first is a copy of a letter from François Cramer to his son William, dated 1841, which was transmitted in the subsequent letter from Mr. S. W. Forster, to Henry Murray, Esq., Edinburgh, regarding the authenticity of the violin.

LETTER FROM F. CRAMER TO HIS SON WILLIAM

My dear William,

As you wish to have the pedigree of the Joseph Guarnerius Violin I bought forty years ago [i.e. c.1801] of a Mr. Mackenzie, a distinguished Amateur in those days, with a warranty of its being a genuine instrument, and soon after sold it, the gentleman who bought it of me died, and his widow returned it to me for sale, as, of course, she had no use for it after his death. It has never been in any other hands, and I can warrant it being a genuine instrument.

Your affectionate father,

François Cramer

37 Upper Charlotte Street, Fitzroy Square [London]

10th June 1841

LETTER FROM S. W. FORSTER, TO H[enry] MURRAY, ESQ., TRANSMITTING THE PRECEDING LETTER AND RECEIPTS

I have much pleasure in transmitting the copies of the above and hope they will give you additional pleasure when gazing on the instrument to which they refer.

With best wishes for your health, and thanks for favour conferred,

I remain,

Yours respectfully,

S. W. Forster

13 Macclesfield Street

Soho Square

21st August 1841

The text of Forster's letter clearly implies that Henry Murray, of Edinburgh, was the new owner of the 1741 Guarneri violin (why else would Forster anticipate Murray 'gazing on the instrument'? – why else would Forster send Murray the receipts?). It also implies that Cramer had previously passed the violin – re-acquired from the unknown widow – to his son, William, who, apparently authorised to sell it, had requested from his father a letter confirming the violin's identity and recent history of ownership. It is to be regretted that Davidson does not reproduce the receipts which S W Forster sent to Murray.

The chronology thus becomes:

- At the start of the nineteenth century, a 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin was sold for £262 by a Mr Mackenzie to the violinist François Cramer; the intermediary was Henry Murray (about whom no further details are known)
- Soon after this date Cramer sold the violin to an unknown purchaser. At the death of the latter (on an unknown date but, clearly, before 1841) his widow returned the violin to Cramer 'for sale'.
- In 1841 Cramer passed the violin to his son, William

- Having received his father's 'pedigree' letter William then sold the violin, in 1841, through S W (Simon Andrew?) Forster, to Henry Murray of Edinburgh (assumed to be the same person as above)
- At the posthumous sale of the effects of Henry Murray the violin was bought for £105 by Alexander Crombie
- In 1846 Crombie sold the violin to Alexander Mackenzie (born c.1820)
- Alexander Mackenzie subsequently passed the violin to his son, Alexander Campbell Mackenzie (1847-1935) who later became the Principal of London's Royal Academy of Music (between 1888 and 1924) and was knighted in 1895.

Adding the aforementioned information from the Tarisio.com website

- Alexander Campbell Mackenzie sold the violin in 1882 to Richard Bennett
- At an unknown date Bennett sold the violin to W E Hill & Sons
- The Hills sold the violin to J T Carrodus in 1893.

A report published in the London newspaper *The Morning Post* on 22nd September 1893 confirms that J T Carrodus bought the 1741 Guarneri violin in that year:

Mr. Carrodus, the eminent violinist, who is the possessor of the famous Joseph Guarnerius del Gesù violin, known as the Canon Joseph, which is valued at £1,000, has recently added another fine specimen of the same make to his interesting collection. Its characteristics are great power and a wonderful sweetness of tone, and it is said to be equal in some respects to the historic fiddle supposed to have been gambled away by Paganini. The [new] instrument is dated 1741. It has had the good fortune nearly always to fall into the hands of distinguished professional performers, and is, consequently, in a perfect state of preservation. It was sold by Simon Andreas [Andrew] Forster to Francois Cramer,¹² and for some years was in the family of Dr. Mackenzie, Principal of the Royal Academy of Music. It eventually came into the possession of Messrs. Hill and Co., the well-known Bond-street dealers, from whom it was purchased by Mr. Carrodus.

As already indicated, a collection of Carrodus instruments and bows was auctioned by Puttick & Simpson on 10th December 1895 following the death of JTC on 13th July 1895.¹³ There were seven items auctioned: three violin bows (two by François Tourte and one by James Tubbs), an 'old viola' an 'old viola bow', an 'old violoncello', and

Lot 14 A Violin, by Joseph Guarnerius del Gesù, in 1741, with case
The history of this Instrument is recorded in a book entitled "THE VIOLIN", by Davidson, and is confirmed by the papers attached to the instrument. About the year 1800, this instrument was in the possession of a Mr. A. Mackenzie, it was bought from him by François Cramer – a celebrated violinist of his day – and in 1841 it was sold to a Mr. Henry Murray by S. A. Forster, a descendant of the well known violin maker, William Forster, and joint author with Sandys of "THE HISTORY OF THE VIOLIN". At the sale of Mr. Murray's effects it was purchased by a Mr. Alexander Crombie of Edinburgh, and in 1846 it became the property of Mr. Alexander Mackenzie, and afterwards of his son Sir Alexander C. Mackenzie, the Principal of the Royal Academy of Music. Later it became one of the instruments in the collection of Mr. Richard Bennett of Lever Hall, and when this collection was dispersed by Messrs W. E. Hill and Sons it was sold by them to the late Mr. Carrodus.

¹² As shown earlier, Francois Cramer obtained his violin from Mr Mackenzie.

¹³ A copy of the auction catalogue, together with the auctioneer's 'sold to' annotations, is held at the British Library, in London. It is this December 1895 auction to which David Laurie refers in his January 1896 letter to *The Strad*.

The writer of this historical chronology has clearly made full use of the information from Peter Davidson. According to the handwritten notes made by the Puttick & Simpson auctioneer the 1741 Guarneri/*Carrodus* violin was sold to ‘Dancock’ (G W Dancocks) for £370 (GBP).

Following the death of G W Dancocks the same violin was auctioned again, on 26th October 1915, again by Puttick & Simpson:

Catalogue of the valuable collection of violins, violas, and violoncellos
formed by the late G. W. Dancocks, Esq., of Hook, Surrey
(sold by order of the Public Trustee).

Lot 187 (out of Lots 171-201) was the 1741 Guarneri/*Carrodus* violin. The auction catalogue (British Library) repeats all the historical information which had been provided in the 1895 catalogue, adding (after ‘... sold by them to the late Mr. Carrodus’) ‘at the dispersal of this collection by Messrs. Puttick and Simpson in 1895, [the violin] was purchased by the late owner’ [i.e. G W Dancocks]. The British Library’s copy of the catalogue – as used by the auctioneer – has two handwritten annotations, in ink, appended to the text which describes the 1741 violin:

*& documents from 1841-1895
with Messrs. W. E. Hill & Sons, & G. Hart guarantees*

The auctioneer’s ‘sold to’ documentation indicates that Lot 187 was sold to ‘Minster’ for £580 (GBP).

The ‘documents from 1841-1895’ – i.e. the ‘papers attached to the instrument’ at the 1895 auction – were evidently still in existence in 1915. It would seem that between 1895 and 1915 the documents were supplemented by the guarantees provided by W E Hill & Sons and by George Hart.

In December 1915 an auction report – *Violins under the hammer* – was published in *The Strad* (p. 230). The reporter – ‘T.P.’ [Towry Piper?] – begins his account with:

A sale of musical instruments held by Messrs. Puttick and Simpson at their Auction Rooms on the 26th of October last proved an event of considerably greater interest than those which have taken place since the war began, and a number of violins and basses from private collections were disposed of; a special catalogue comprising the collection of the late Mr. G. W. Dancocks being issued. The lots dispersed numbered 216, and in a few cases fair prices were obtained in spite of the unfavourable condition of the market.

[...]

Naturally the chief interest was centred in the violin by Guarneri *del Gesù*, dated 1741, which was sold to Mr. Minster, an American buyer as the writer understands, for £580. This was one of the two “Josephs” formerly owned by the late J. T. Carrodus; the other [i.e. the 1744 violin] is still [in 1915] in the possession of that artist’s family, unless we are misinformed. This [1741] fiddle is described in Davidson’s book, and amongst its former owners may be mentioned François Cramer, Sir Alexander Mackenzie, and Mr. Richard Bennett, the well-known collector. The varnish is yellow-golden, and, accepting as correct the measurements given to the writer (13 15/16th inches [354mm]), the body is of unusual length. The instrument is guaranteed by Messrs. Hart and Messrs. Hill.

A definitive identification of ‘Mr. Minster’ has not been achieved but it is almost certain that he was Leonard Rollman Minster (1887-1969) who was a grandson of Isaac Rollman, the founder of Rollman & Sons, a major department store in Cincinnati, Ohio, USA. It is very likely that Mr Minster subsequently returned to the US with his 1741 Guarneri/*Carrodus* violin.¹⁴

¹⁴ William Henley, in his listing of Guarneri *del Gesù* violins, identifies the 1741 *Carrodus* violin and comments: ‘Sold at Puttick’s for £370, 1895. Passed over to America 1920.’ (*Universal Dictionary of Violin and Bow Makers*, Vol. II, p. 255). Mr Minster also bought, at the same 1915 auction, a 1763 Guadagnini violin (Lot 188) for £300. I am indebted to Christine Windheuser (Smithsonian Institution) for her ingenious investigations which resulted in the identification of Mr Minster.

In September 1947 two American violin dealers, Rembert Wurlitzer and Kenneth Warren, travelled to England to acquire high-quality violins, violas, and cellos, for export back to the US. During this trip Wurlitzer (at Warren's suggestion) made a hurried detour to Scotland to purchase an unexpectedly-available 1741 Guarneri violin from the Glasgow dealer Andrew Smillie (1879-1948). Having bought the violin Wurlitzer 'asked Mr. Hill to write a certificate on it'¹⁵ (see later for what is assumed to be the requested certificate).

A letter, written by Warren, giving an account of Wurlitzer's purchase in Glasgow, was published, verbatim, in the *Chicago Sunday Tribune* on 23rd July 1950.¹⁶ Having described the events of September 1947 Warren adds that in the spring of 1950 he saw the 1741 Guarneri violin in the hands of the American violinist Aaron Rosand, 'and I encouraged him to buy it'. Rosand did not act upon Warren's encouragement, instead eventually buying from Wurlitzer the Guarneri violin known as the *Kochanski*. Wurlitzer sold his 1741 'Smillie' violin – now identified as a *Carrodus* violin on the strength of the Hills' certificate (see below) – to a Mr M Adler on an unknown date during 1950 (but earlier than August of that year).

In a letter to Mr Adler (4th August 1950) Wurlitzer states that the former's newly-purchased violin

was for many years in the possession of ~~John~~ [sic] Bernard Carrodus and of his father.

Clearly, Wurlitzer did not know that JTC only bought his yellow/amber 1741 violin in 1893, just two years before he died,¹⁷ and, evidently, Wurlitzer also knew nothing of the 1895 and 1915 auctions (and Mr Minster of Cincinnati). Wurlitzer also informed Adler that his violin

is described in a small book which Mr. Carrodus wrote on his method of violin playing.

This 'small book' is the aforementioned collected edition of JTC's *Chats to Violin Students* within which there is only one brief reference (hardly a description) to the 1741 violin:

Another [Guarneri violin] which I purchased last year has a tone which almost equals the Cannon Joseph, but, being a yellow varnish, is not quite so beautiful in appearance.¹⁸

In the summer of 1954 the 1741 violin was sold by Mr Adler to a Mr C M Paul, accompanied by the following documents:

1. a certificate from Hart & Son, London, dated 18th January 1924
2. a certificate from W E Hill & Sons, London, dated 15th December 1947 (with 'history' letter)
3. a 'copy' certificate from Rembert Wurlitzer, dated 16th January 1954.

If the 1741 Guarneri violin which was bought by Mr Paul was the same violin as had been bought by Mr Minster in 1915, and if, by 1954, the only supportive documents for the violin were the three certificates listed above, then it would seem that all the 'documents from 1841-1895' and the 'Messrs. W. E. Hill & Sons, & G. Hart guarantees' that had been present at the 1915 auction had disappeared. If Leonard Rollman Minster, being American, took the violin with him to the USA then why was it apparently back in London in January 1924, with George Hart writing a second guarantee/certificate? – what had happened to the first? In addition, what had happened to the Hill guarantee?

¹⁵ Letter from Wurlitzer to Mr M Adler, 4th August 1950.

¹⁶ Warren mistakenly identifies the violin in question as the 'Hegedus' (which is label-dated 1734).

¹⁷ The 'history' letter which accompanied the Hills' 1947 certificate makes no mention of their selling the violin to JTC in 1893.

¹⁸ Carrodus, *Chats*, p. 59. In a letter dated 30th June 1954 to the subsequent owner of the violin, Kenneth Warren also refers to JTC's 'method' book; Warren locates 'mention of your [1741] violin' within the book's Preface. The book's Preface was written by Henry Saint-George, is dated August 1895, and does not contain any mention of the 1741 Guarneri violin.

The Hart & Son certificate, marked *Duplicate*, of 18th January 1924, states:

We certify that the *Violin*, purchased of us by *H. S. Murray Esq. of Galashiels* is the work of *Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù*.

Remarks: *A fine example of the maker dated 1741. Handsome wood, golden brown varnish.*

Hart & Son
*Geo. Hart*¹⁹

It is unclear whether this is a duplicate of the Hart guarantee which was identified at the 1915 Dancocks auction, or a duplicate of an entirely new certificate which was issued, for the first time, in 1924. It is noticeable that Hart does not associate H S Murray's 1741 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin with J T Carrodus, and his vague 'Remarks' could be applied to almost any *del Gesù* violin from 1741; he does not even specify whether the violin's back plate is in one, or two, pieces, nor the quality or direction of the flames. No photographs are attached to the certificate, an absence which renders the document largely irrelevant.

The W E Hill & Sons certificate of 15th December 1947 states:

We certify that the *Violin in the possession of The Rudolf Wurlitzer Company of New York, U.S.A.* was made by *Joseph Guarnerius del Gesù* and bears a label dated 1741.

Description *The back in two pieces of handsome wood marked by a small curl descending slightly to the right, that of the sides is more pronounced, the head of faint and broad curl. The table of even and rather open grain and the varnish of a golden brown colour. This instrument is a characteristic example of the above period of the maker's work.*

William E. Hill Sons

An accompanying letter (same date) sets out the history of this violin 'as far as it is known to us':

During the latter part of the last century, it was in the hands of one of our leading professional players, J. T. Carrodus, who was a pupil of Molique and later led the Royal Covent Garden Orchestra in London. After his death, it remained in his family for some time being used by his son who was also a professional player. He [the son] later sold it to Sir Alexander Mackenzie. From him it passed into the hands of Mr. Murray of Galashiels, the owner at one time of many fine instruments, who sold it to Mr. Horace Fellowes, a well known Violin Professor and quartet player, living in Glasgow and in whose possession it has remained until recent times.

Signed: William E. Hill & Sons.²⁰

It is unclear why the Hills should write that after JTC's death the 1741 violin remained in the Carrodus family 'for some time', or why they should write that JTC's son (which son?) 'later' sold the 1741 Guarneri violin to Sir Alexander (Campbell) Mackenzie.²¹ As already indicated, the 1741 violin was auctioned in December 1895 and bought by G W Dancocks; the violin was auctioned again in 1915 and bought by Mr Minster (and, almost certainly, taken to the US). It is difficult to believe that the Hills were unaware of the outcome from these two auctions especially since they, and George Hart, had a close commercial relationship with Puttick & Simpson.²²

Hart's 'H. S. Murray Esq. of Galashiels' and the Hills' 'Mr. Murray of Galashiels' are assumed to be the same person (who risks being confused with the aforementioned Henry Murray of Edinburgh who

¹⁹ Italicised text is handwritten on the certificate; all else is pre-printed. A scan of the document was received by the present author from the Oesterreichische Nationalbank.

²⁰ The 'signature' is typed rather than handwritten.

²¹ In his autobiography (*A Musician's Narrative*, Cassell & Co. Ltd., London, 1927) Sir A C Mackenzie makes no mention of a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin, nor does he mention J T Carrodus, or a son.

²² See James Coover, *Music at Auction*, Harmonie Park Press, Detroit, 1988, p. 35.

died in the early 1840s). According to Ernest Doring ‘Captain H S Murray of Galashiels, Scotland’ owned a quartet of Antonio Stradivari instruments which were sold ‘by the trustees of his estate’ in 1926, through Jay C Freeman, to the Wurlitzer Collection in America.²³ Captain H S Murray died, therefore, in 1926 (possibly 1925) which would suggest a date of birth no earlier than 1845. Clearly, Captain H S Murray of Galashiels is not Henry Murray of Edinburgh.

Horace Fellowes (1875-1975), a Professor of Violin at the Scottish Academy of Music, is not to be confused with Edmund Horace Fellowes who was a Church of England clergyman and also a musicologist who did much to promote 16th- and 17th-century music. Such confusion is evident on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com web page for the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin (ID 40255), and the confusion is compounded by the website’s erroneous identification of ‘Enthoven’ and ‘Charles Davis’ as owners of the violin after Horace Fellowes. Henry Chapman Enthoven owned a 1741 Guarneri violin with a one-piece back plate (the 1741 Guarneri *Carrodus* violin has a two-piece back plate) which was inspected by the Hills in London, and by Charles Gand in Paris, around 1880-1881.²⁴ After Enthoven’s death in 1897 his violin was bought by Charles Davis, was then sold to the collector Richard Bennett, and from Bennett passed to the violinist Paul Kochanski who retained possession until his death in 1934. This *Kochanski* violin then sat for many years in the vaults at Rembert Wurlitzer’s violin-dealership in New York until it was bought in 1957 by the American violinist Aaron Rosand (see earlier).

Information received by the present author indicates that Professor Horace Fellowes sold his Guarneri *Carrodus* violin to a Mrs Burger (biographical details are unknown) and she sold the violin in 1933 to an unknown purchaser. Also unknown is the route by which the violin reached Andrew Smillie in Glasgow. One might have expected Smillie to provide Rembert Wurlitzer with his own written assurance with respect to the recent history of the 1741 violin but no such document is known. Given that Wurlitzer immediately requested a Hill certificate for the violin it would seem that Smillie, in September 1947, could only provide Wurlitzer with Hart’s incomplete certificate of 1924; evidently Smillie did not have the 1841-1895 documents nor the 1915 Hill and/or Hart guarantees.

Wurlitzer’s own certificate of 16th January 1954 was accompanied by three photographs of the 1741 Guarneri violin. Distinctive markings on the front and back plates can be seen to be replicated in the photographs of the violin produced by the Sotheby auction house in London when they auctioned the 1741 ‘ex-Carrodus’ violin on 19th March 1986.²⁵ In their auction catalogue Sotheby’s identify only the same three certificates as listed earlier.

No photographic documentation was provided in 1895 or in 1915 when the 1741 Guarneri violin which had belonged to J T Carrodus was auctioned by Puttick & Simpson. Given this deficiency – given, also, the disappearance of all the ‘papers and documents’ and the Hart and Hill ‘guarantees’ – given the unsatisfactory condition of Hart’s 1924 certificate – and given the inaccuracies contained in the Hills’ ‘history’ letter – it cannot be securely demonstrated that the violin which was bought by Rembert Wurlitzer in Glasgow in September 1947 had any previous connection with J T Carrodus.

²³ Ernest Doring, *How Many Strads? Our Heritage from the Master* (William Lewis & Son, Chicago, 1945), pp. 85, 99, 171, and 324.

²⁴ A description, dated 1881, of Enthoven’s Guarneri violin appears in Gand’s *Catalogue descriptif*, p. 99. See section e) for further information about Charles Gand and his *Catalogue*. Enthoven’s violin has no documented existence prior to 1880.

²⁵ The same markings can be observed in the photographs provided in Rudolf Hopfner’s *Meisterwerke der Geigenbaukunst*, pp. 96-97.

d) The 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin

The evidentially-supported history of this violin begins with Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume who, in 1855, sold a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin, label-dated 1744, to the violinist Louis Eller (who was born at Graz, Austria, 9th June 1820); the price of the violin was 5,000 francs. As a virtuoso violinist Eller successfully toured the principal European countries and gave many concerts in the south-west of France, especially in and around the town of Pau. In the late 1850s Eller was afflicted with an incurable disease which progressively prevented him from performing. In the spring of 1862 his medical condition worsened markedly and he died on 12th July 1862 at the age of 42.

1855 hatte er noch in Paris einem kostbaren Guarnerius (Joseph) für 5000 Francken erstanden, und erst seit er in den Besitz dieses herrlichen Instrumentes getreten war, fühlte er sich in der Beherrschung seines Materials vollkommen unbeschränkt.

In 1855, in Paris, he bought a precious Giuseppe Guarneri [violin] for 5,000 Francs; only after he came into possession of this magnificent instrument did he feel completely unfettered in the mastery of his [musical] material.²⁶

David Laurie, in his *The Reminiscences of a Fiddle Dealer* (p. 144), provides the following narrative:

A young and very eminent violinist who lived in Vienna, in the [eighteen] seventies, was ordered to Pau for his health. He went in the early spring, and before the summer came he died there.²⁷ A marquis and his lady, who were staying at Pau, were very kind to him and previous to his death had him removed to their house, where they tended him with the greatest kindness until the end. He had with him a splendid Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu violin which he bequeathed to his kind friends. In course of time they also died and his violin was for sale. As soon as I heard of it I took steps to procure it and managed to do so, although at a very high price.

[see below - § - for the continuation of Laurie's text]

Laurie does not identify the young violinist, nor the names of the kind Marquis and his wife, nor the dates when the couple died, their deaths resulting in the Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (of as-yet unspecified label-date) coming onto the market.

In the January 1896 letter from David Laurie to *The Strad*, having written at some length about the 1708 Stradivari violin which he sold to J T Carrodus, Laurie then turns to the “Joseph Guarnerius” violin, and, through his letter, expands his *Reminiscences* narrative:

A few years after [the death of the young violinist] both the Marquis and his lady died, and the violin with other things were to be sent to Paris and sold, but I did not know this until I had gone to Pau, where I got the address of the *avocat* who had charge of the estate, [the *avocat* being] in Paris to whom I applied on my return.²⁸ He informed me he had sent the instrument to Vuillaume the great [*sic*] to get it valued, and would then treat [negotiate] with me, but as I had never seen [the Guarneri violin] I asked him for a note [addressed] to Vuillaume to allow him to shew it to me. I was very much struck with [the violin], it being different to any other “Joseph” I had ever seen. It was a rough, carelessly made one, date 1744, but its state of preservation was perfect, having still its original hand [neck/peg-box/scroll] and the [bass-] bar inside had never been changed. Its wood, although not showy, was perfect in quality for tone.²⁹

²⁶ Biographical information and quotation (present author's translation) sourced from *Zur Erinnerung an Louis Eller*, Rudolf Kuntze, Dresden, 1864.

²⁷ Laurie's narrative is incorrectly located in the 1870s rather than the 1860s.

²⁸ The Carrodus/Carmichael letter (see later) dates the arrival in Paris of the *ex- Eller* violin to the year 1872.

²⁹ It is unclear whether it was the ‘original hand’ and the unchanged bass-bar which made the violin ‘different to any other “Joseph” I had ever seen’.

Thus the chronology for this Guarneri *del Gesù* violin – a violin now unambiguously dated by Laurie to 1744 – was: Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume, Louis Eller, unidentified Marquis and wife, unidentified Paris lawyer, and, again, J-B Vuillaume. Given the close commercial relationship between Vuillaume and Laurie it is quite likely that the former alerted the latter to the violin's existence ('as soon as I heard of it I took steps to procure it ...'). It would seem that, with Vuillaume's valuation having been established, Laurie bought the Guarneri violin ('at a very high price') through the lawyer who was handling the estate of the deceased Marquis and his wife.

Laurie continues (*Reminiscences*, p. 144):

§ [The violin with its 'original hand'] had been in my possession only a short time when I sold it [1872-73?] to an artiste in Germany, a pupil of De Bériot, who had carried off first prize and medal from the Conservatoire of Music in Brussels amid general acclamation.³⁰

Information received from the Brussels Conservatoire indicates that Rudolf Gleichauff entered the Conservatoire in 1846, was taught by de Bériot, and won 'le prix d'honneur' in 1849; the Carrodus/Carmichael letter (see below) confirms that the 'artiste in Germany' was Gleichauff. In 1878 Gleichauff was appointed a violin professor at the newly-opened Hoch Conservatory in Frankfurt; he died in 1902.

Laurie continues (*Reminiscences*, pp. 144-145):

This gentleman professed to be greatly pleased with the instrument, as well he might, for it was in perfect state of preservation. Even the original hand was on it (although it had been lengthened at the upper inside block in the body by a wedge) a very rare thing in a Guarnerius del Jesu. I drew [the purchaser's] attention to this fact most particularly and begged, as a great favour, that he would not meddle with it as even though its thickness was a little greater than that of a modern hand, he would very soon get accustomed to it. Also I pointed out that although [the violin] had the original bass bar it had been remounted in all other respects by Vuillaume and did not require any further alteration [...].

'Six or seven months elapsed' before Laurie discovered that, despite his implorings, Gleichauff had had the violin's neck replaced, as well as the bass-bar and the sound-post, the last two alterations resulting in the violin having 'the left [bass] side of the table falling in, while the right side was above the level from the centre to the edge of the f.' Laurie bought back the violin from Gleichauff and 'brought the violin to Paris and placed it in the hands of MM. Gand & Bernardel to be put right again' (*Reminiscences*, p. 148).

In his letter to *The Strad* Laurie writes: 'I then brought [the violin] to London and sold it to an amateur there, who gave it to a dealer in London afterwards to sell for him, and from whom Mr. Carrodus finally purchased it.' Laurie concludes his *Reminiscences* narrative (pp. 148-149) with the same information but expressed slightly differently: 'I [then] sold [the violin] to a well-known amateur who eventually placed it on sale with Mr. Hill. It became the property of the late M. [John Tiplady] Carrodus.'

A letter written by J T Carrodus on 17th January 1895 to the song-composer Mary Carmichael (1851-1935) contains the following information about his *ex- Eller, ex- Gleichauff, 1744 Guarneri violin*:³¹

³⁰ Charles Auguste de Bériot (1802-1870) taught at the Brussels Conservatoire between 1843 and 1852. If the *ex- Eller* violin was returned to Paris in 1872, and was in Laurie's hands 'only a short time', then perhaps Laurie's sale of this violin to his 'artiste in Germany' took place in 1873 or 1874.

³¹ The text of the letter is transcribed verbatim from the lower part of the letter's first page and the entirety of the concluding second page; the upper part of the letter's first page has not been seen by the present author.

[...] In the appendix of a book by Davidson (now out of print) it says “that the Violin is supposed to have been the one gambled away by Paganini”. I have never proved this further. I have a certificate which I got with the Violin of Villaume [*sic*] of Paris which says it passed from his hands in 1833 sold to Eller whom he calls a celebrated Violinist. In 1872 it was returned to Villiaume [*sic*] [?after the death of the kind Marquis and his wife] & afterwards sold to Mr. Rudolf Gleichauff by Mr. Laurie of Glasgow. I bought it through Hill’s of 34 Bond St about 12 years ago [i.e. c.1883].

With kind regards

Yrs very sincerely

J. T. Carrodus

Vuillaume’s certificate (current whereabouts unknown) confirms that the *del Gesù* violin which he had sold to Louis Eller in 1855 (not 1833; see below) is the violin which was identified by Laurie as being dated 1744, was the violin which Laurie then sold to Gleichauff, and was the violin which, having been retrieved and repaired, eventually passed into the hands of the Hills and was bought by J T Carrodus in 1883.

One aspect of Vuillaume’s certificate (as reported by Carrodus) – ‘which says it [i.e. Carrodus’s 1744 Guarneri violin] passed from [Vuillaume’s] hands in 1833 sold to Eller’ – is implausible. It is not likely that Louis Eller bought a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin from Vuillaume when Eller was aged just twelve or thirteen; a purchase in 1855 (as is clearly identified in the 1864 Eller memoir) is much more believable. The probability is that Carrodus mis-read Vuillaume’s numerals – especially the French ‘5’s – and, as a result, mistakenly wrote ‘33’ in his letter to Mary Carmichael (Vuillaume’s slanted and ornate handwriting can be extremely difficult to read). Given the mental and physical strain under which JTC was living during this final year of his life – England’s most celebrated violinist and constantly at the beck and call of everyone in the musical world – such a mistake, within a hurriedly written response to a letter of enquiry, would be understandable. The spelling mistakes – *Villaume*, *Villiaume* – are likely also attributable to the same debilitating tensions.

The ‘book by [Peter] Davidson (now out of print)’ was a revised and enlarged edition of his 1871 publication *The Violin: a concise exposition of the general principles of construction theoretically and practically treated* (Porteous Brothers, Glasgow), the new edition being re-titled as *The Violin: its construction theoretically and practically treated* (F. Pitman, London, 1880). Writing (pp. 278-9) about David Laurie’s career, and listing many of the instruments with which Laurie was involved as buyer or seller, Davidson identifies

the “Canon” Joseph Guarnerius Violin, ex Vicomte ____, Pau, now owned by C. G. Meier, Esq. London; a very large and handsomely wooded Violin, with beautiful red varnish, said to have been the Violin Paganini lost at play.

Clearly, the Vicomte (of Pau) connects precisely with the ‘kind Marquis and his wife’ described by David Laurie, and there is no reason to doubt Davidson when he identifies C G Meier as the pre-1880 owner of the ‘very large’ Guarneri violin which had ‘beautiful red varnish’.³² In Laurie’s *Reminiscences* (p. [172]) is a list:

‘Prices of Italian Instruments

The following entries are extracted from his sales account’

Within the entries is the following item:

Dec. 28, 1877. – Joseph Guarnerius violin (“Canon”) £620 [GBP]

³² ‘Pre-1880’ since Davidson’s revised and enlarged volume was published in 1880.

Notwithstanding the absence of a purchaser's name all the evidence points towards C G Meier being the purchaser of Laurie's 'Joseph Guarnerius violin ("Canon")'; it is C G Meier who is Laurie's aforementioned 'amateur' (or 'well-known amateur'). A revised narrative for this 1744 violin can be constructed thus:

- Louis Eller, who, in 1855 buys a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin from Vuillaume
- the Marquis (or Vicomte) and his wife (Pau)
- the Parisian *avocat* and Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume (who, in 1872, writes a valuation)
- David Laurie, who purchases the 1744 Guarneri violin 'at a very high price'
- Rudolf Gleichauff, who allows the violin to be damaged
- David Laurie, who retrieves the violin, has it repaired in Paris, and brings it to London
- C G Meier, who, in December 1877, buys from Laurie the very expensive violin (with 'beautiful red' varnish) which the latter identified as the Guarneri "Canon" violin
- Meier subsequently consigns this violin to the Hills in London
- the Hills sell the violin to J T Carrodus in 1883
- the 1895 letter from JTC to Mary Carmichael identifies his violin as that which Vuillaume sold to Louis Eller
- the information given in 1895 by Ada Carrodus to the reporter from the *Leeds Mercury* confirms JTC's violin as being dated 1744.

Ada Carrodus writes in her memoir of her husband's 1744 violin:

In this year also [the year 1883 is clearly implied by both the preceding and the succeeding text] he purchased through Mr. Laurie of Glasgow, the fine specimen of "Joseph Guarnerius del Jesu" which he used always as his solo violin. The tone is so fine and powerful that it is known as the "Cannon Joseph" and by some authorities is said to have been one of Paganini's violins which he gambled away. It is now in the possession of his son Robert (his sixth son), a violinist of distinction. (*A Life Story*, pp. 88-89)

In the Preface to her memoir, Ada Carrodus writes that 'With no notes from the pen of the subject of these memoirs [i.e. JTC], I feel hesitation in writing them [...].' Working from her historically-limited first-hand knowledge, Ada's identification of David Laurie as the 1883 origin of her husband's "Cannon Joseph" violin, rather than the Hills, is likely nothing more than a simple misunderstanding; JTC's letter to Mary Carmichael makes clear that he bought his 1744 violin from the Hills.

Ada may have misunderstood the involvement of David Laurie but she could not be mistaken when she identifies Robert George Carrodus as the post-1895 owner and player of her husband's 1744 Guarneri violin. Robert joined the second violins of the London Symphony Orchestra in 1909 and was promoted to the first violins in 1914. As a soldier he was wounded in action in July 1918 but survived the war and remained a member of the LSO until 1924. Subsequently, in 1934, Robert was leader of the orchestra of the Carl Rosa Opera Company. He died in 1966. The current location of Robert's 1744 "Cannon Joseph" Guarneri violin is unknown.

e) Charles-Nicolas-Eugène Gand

From 1870 onwards, until one year before he died (1892), Charles Gand, the Paris-based violin dealer, compiled the 252 descriptions of Stradivari and Guarneri instruments which make up his *Catalogue*

descriptif des Instruments de Stradivarius et J Guarnerius. It is assumed that *J Guarnerius* refers to Giuseppe Guarneri *del Gesù* rather than his father, Giuseppe Guarneri *filius Andreae*.³³

Charles Gand's descriptions of instruments – two on each page of the *Catalogue* (except for page 2 which is entirely taken up with a description of the *Le Messie* violin) – are written in black ink, followed by details, in red ink, of previous owners and subsequent owners together with the dates when the instruments were sold and the prices paid; each description also identifies the name of the owner of the instrument on the date when Gand noted down his observations. The 252 descriptions are assumed to be either of instruments which were bought or sold through Gand & Bernardel Frères, or instruments which were repaired and maintained by the workshop personnel. Some of the descriptions may be of instruments which Gand saw in the possession of Parisian colleagues.

The measurements supplied by Gand – usually only for the body length of the instrument – use the French system known as the 'Foot of the King' (*Pied du Roi*) as had also been used, sixty years earlier, by Il Conte Ignazio Alessandro Cozio di Salabue, in which one *pouce* is equivalent to 27.07mm and one *ligne* is 2.26mm.

On the upper half of p. 87 of his *Catalogue* Gand writes a description of a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* belonging to David Laurie; the date of the description is 1879:

(année 1879) Monsieur Laurie, Glasgow (Ecosse)
Violon Joseph Guarnerius, 13 pouces 1 ligne, année 1744
Fond d'une pièce, belles ondes remontant à droite, jolies éclisses
Table de deux pièces, beau sapin un peu fin au milieu, cassure au-dessus de l'f gauche à l'endroit de la barre. Tête cassée à la cheville du La, trous de la chanterelle et du La rebouchés. Vernis jaune doré.
*1879 M^r Gleichauff, 8,000 f.*³⁴

(1879) M. Laurie, Glasgow, Scotland
Giuseppe Guarneri [*del Gesù*] violin, 13 *pouces* 1 *ligne* [354.2mm], year 1744
The back plate is in one piece, beautiful flames rising [from left] to right. Attractive ribs.
The front plate is made from two pieces, beautiful spruce, [the growth rings] slightly narrow in the middle. There is a split above the bass-side *f*-hole in the area of the [bass-] bar.
The head [has been] broken at the A-string peg; the holes for the E-string and the A-string pegs have been bushed. **The varnish is golden yellow.** [present author's emphasis]
1879 M. Gleichauff, 8,000 francs.

David Laurie sold a 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin on 29th June 1879 for the sum of £320 (GBP); the purchaser is not identified but 1879 is the same year in which Charles Gand wrote his *Catalogue descriptif* text, and Gand indicates that 1879 was the year in which Gleichauff bought Laurie's golden yellow 1744 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin for 8,000 francs. In the late nineteenth century the exchange rate between British Pounds and French Francs was 1:25; Laurie's sale price of £320 converts, exactly, to 8,000 French Francs. The evidence points towards Rudolf Gleichauff buying the golden-yellow 1744 Guarneri violin in 1879 as a replacement for the very large, red 1744 Guarneri violin –

³³ Gand's *Catalogue* was published as a photographic facsimile, in 1994, by Les Amis de la Musique, Spa, Belgium.

³⁴ One noticeable absence from Gand's descriptive text is any red-ink annotation that this violin was *ex-Eller* (i.e. the type of annotation which occurs frequently within Gand's *Catalogue*). Gand's French text is copied – exactly, and without any annotations regarding post-Gleichauff owners of the violin – in the two sales ledgers compiled during the early twentieth century by personnel at the Paris firm of Caressa & Français; see *Jacques Francais Rare Violins Inc., Photographic Archive and Business Records* (Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of American History, Archives Center, Washington; Box 55, Folder 2 and Folder 4).

ex-Eller – which he had bought from Laurie some years earlier (1872-73?), which he had allowed to be damaged, and which he had then sold back to Laurie.³⁵

f) The 1743 Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (erroneously known as the *Carrodus*)

A Guarneri *del Gesù* violin (ID 40447) – soubriquet *Carrodus* – is listed on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com website. The sequence of ownership is stated to be Louis Eller, J-B Vuillaume, David Laurie, Rudolf Gleichauff ‘until c. 1879’, Laurie, C G Meier ‘1881-1886’, W E Hill ‘from 1886’, and J T Carrodus ‘until 1895’. Further owners are listed as Major C E S Phillips ‘1895-1909’,³⁶ Felix Landau ‘1909-1949’, Ossy Renardy, Henry Hottinger, Rembert Wurlitzer, E P Engleman, David Fulton, and the present owner who, anonymously, loaned the violin to the Australian Chamber Orchestra for the use of the orchestra’s leader, Richard Tognetti. According to the Tarisio.com website this violin is label-dated 1743.

Laurie sold the violin to a musician from Frankfurt called Gleichhoff, a pupil of de Bériot. [...] it is mistakenly listed in Charles-Eugène Gand’s notebooks of 1879 as belonging to the year 1744.³⁷ Around 1881 Laurie sold it in London to C. G. Meier, a wealthy amateur who owned several fine Stradivari violins. After some five years Meier sold it to W. E. Hill, who passed it to the London violinist J. T. Carrodus, whose name it still bears.³⁸

If Gand’s only mistake was to write ‘1744’ rather than ‘1743’ then the clear implication is that in all other respects Gand’s description of the golden yellow 1744 violin should match the Biddulph98 description of the 1743 violin. However, within Biddulph98 it is further stated (Vol. One, p. 131) that ‘The wood of the back [plate of the 1743 violin], one piece of quarter-sawn maple, has a modest figure compared to some of del Gesù’s more spectacular violins’ (cf. Gand’s description: ‘beautiful flames’). In Biddulph98, Vol. Two, p. 109, it is stated that the varnish of the 1743 violin is ‘orange-brown’ (cf. Gand: ‘golden yellow’); in the same location the back-length of the violin is specified as ‘352.5mm’ (cf. Gand: ‘354.2mm’).

Photographs (Biddulph98, Vol. One, opp. p. 131) of the one-piece back plate of the 1743 violin show faint flames which gently descend from left to right. The Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com photographs of the violin confirm the descent of the back-plate flames from left to right, as do the photographs of the violin in the 2015 *The Strad* calendar for the month of December.

Clearly, the 1743 violin is not the golden yellow 1744 violin which is described by Charles Gand – *belles ondes remontant à droite* – ‘beautiful flames rising [from left] to right’; Gand did not make a mistake. The mistake is that the writers of the Biddulph98 text (and the compiler of the Tarisio.com information) have attached the history of ownership for the 1744 Eller/JTC violin to an entirely different violin dated 1743.

³⁵ Rudolf Gleichauff was also a one-time owner of Stradivari violins dated 1700 and 1713, both instruments being bought through David Laurie.

³⁶ Major Charles Edward Stanley Phillips was born in 1871 and was a pioneer in the science of radiology. He was an accomplished violinist and owned a Stradivari violin. See http://mpss.iop.org/the_trust/biographies/phillips/ (accessed October 2016).

³⁷ No evidential justification for the statement regarding Gand’s ‘mistake’ is offered.

³⁸ *Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù*, Peter Biddulph, London, 1998, Vol. One, p. 131 (hereafter cited as ‘Biddulph98’).

The Cozio Archive within the Tarisio.com website (ID 40447) indicates that in 1895 the firm of W. E. Hill & Sons sold a Guarneri *del Gesù* violin to Major C E S Phillips, and in 1909 the violin passed on to Dr Felix Landau, of Berlin. In their 1931 *Guarneri* monograph (p. 91), the Hills identify this violin as ‘1743, Dr. Felix Landau, ex Carrodus’. As already shown, the written evidence from Ada Carrodus is that her husband’s 1744 Guarneri violin with red/dark red varnish was not sold to anyone after his death in 1895, instead remaining in the Carrodus family, owned and played by Robert George Carrodus. The origin and pre-1895 history of the Guarneri violin sold by the Hills to Major Phillips is unknown; documents which might clarify the details of this sale are not publicly available.

The 1743 violin which is identified on the Cozio Archive/Tarisio.com website as the ‘\$15 million’ violin loaned to the Australian Chamber Orchestra may have been made by Guarneri *del Gesù* but the historical evidence does not demonstrate an association between this violin and John Tiplady Carrodus.

3. Summary

The two Guarneri *del Gesù* violins owned by John Tiplady Carrodus were

1. a 1741 violin with ‘amber’ (or ‘yellow’) varnish which can be traced back at least as far as François Cramer. It was bought by JTC from the Hills in 1893. This violin was auctioned in December 1895 and sold to G W Dancocks, and then, in 1915, was auctioned again and sold to Mr Minster. The history of this violin, post 1915, is unknown.
2. a 1744 violin – ‘very large’ and with ‘red’ (or ‘dark red’) varnish – which was briefly in the hands of Rudolf Gleichauff during which time it was damaged. The violin was subsequently bought by JTC from the Hills, in London, in 1883. The violin was used by Robert George Carrodus for at least 20 years after the 1895 death of JTC³⁹ but whether Robert George eventually sold the violin, and, if so, to whom (and when) is unknown.

The golden-yellow 1744 Guarneri violin sold in 1879 by David Laurie through Charles Gand to Rudolf Gleichauff has no connection with the 1744 very large/red/dark-red Guarneri *Carrodus* violin (see 2. above). The history of the golden yellow violin, post Gleichauff, is unknown.

Dr N Sackman: Associate Professor, Department of Music, University of Nottingham (retired). Author of *The 'Messiah' violin: a reliable history?* (2015); see the themessiahviolin.uk website for details. Author of an historical study of the Stradivari *Habeneck* violin, published in the Journal of the American Musical Instrument Society, 2016, and re-published on the website. Author of an historical study of the Stradivari *Chant du Cygne* violin (Journal of the Galpin Society, spring 2017). Author of a study of the ‘original’ neck of the Stradivari *Soil* violin (also available on the themessiahviolin.uk website).

³⁹ See the aforementioned commentary from Towry Piper(?) with respect to the 1915 Dancocks auction.